

EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY

Value incommensurability and the politics
of recognition

Steven R. Smith

SUB Hamburg



A/578664



Contents

Preface	vii	
Acknowledgements	xi	
one	Equality, diversity and radical politics	1
	Introduction	1
	Establishing the parameters of the equality and diversity debate	4
	Radical politics and universalism versus particularism	7
	Resolving the conflict between the values of equality and diversity	11
	Value incommensurability and celebrating difference	18
	Celebrating difference and justice as reciprocity	22
two	Value incommensurability	31
	Introduction	31
	Value incommensurability and 'covering values'	33
	Values and quantity versus quality	36
	Objects and structure: the Platonic versus Nietzschean viewpoints	38
	Accidents, attachments and the creation of value or meaning	41
	Regret and incommensurability	48
	Value relativism and becoming attached	51
three	Empathic imagination and its limits	59
	Introduction	59
	Liberal egalitarian political philosophy and the perspective of others	60
	First- and second-order empathic imagination	64
	The separateness of persons and objective accounts of well-being	67
	Agency and surprise	70
	Learning from others who are agents: general implications for policy and practice	75
four	Critiquing compassion-based social relations	83
	Introduction	83
	Choice, responsibility and luck in liberal egalitarian theory	84
	The role of compassion and pity in theories of redistributive justice	86
	Liberal egalitarian teleology and well-being	88
	Well-being and luck revisited	90
	Luck, agency, separate persons and justice as reciprocity	95
	Keeping our distance in compassion-based social relations	101

five	Egalitarianism, disability and monistic ideals	107
	Introduction	107
	Reinterpretations of the medical model	109
	Reinterpretations of the social model	112
	Impairment as talent, and pain as disvalue and value	117
	Identity, human agency, struggle and oppression	122
	Selfhood, utilitarianism, value conflict and disability	125
six	Equality, identity and disability	131
	Introduction	131
	Kantian ethics: needs, rights and citizenship in policy and practice	133
	Nietzsche as a surprising ally of the disability rights movement	137
	From Kant to Nietzsche in more than one uneasy move	142
	Postmodernism and how irresolvable conflicts can be radical and dynamic	146
seven	Paradox and the limits of reason	153
	Introduction	153
	The exaggerated divide between analytical and continental philosophy	157
	A bridge not too far between existentialists and value incommensurabilists	161
	Equality, diversity and incommensurable values	163
	Recognition and reciprocity in liberal egalitarian communities	166
	References	175
	Index	187