

1256 483 664

Reforming Education Finance in Transition Countries

*Six Case Studies in Per
Capita Financing Systems*

Juan Diego Alonso and Alonso Sánchez, editors

C 265519



THE WORLD BANK
Washington, D.C.

Contents

Foreword	xi
Contributors	xiii
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xv
Executive Summary	xvii
1. Reforming Education Financing Systems in Transition Countries: An Introduction to Six Case Studies	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. From Input-Based Financing to Per Capita Financing	2
1.3. About This Book	7
2. Per Capita Financing of General Education in Armenia	10
2.1. Introduction	10
2.2. Background	11
2.3. The Design of the Funding Formula	13
2.4. The Implementation of the Funding Formula	15
2.5. Assessment of Outcomes	18
2.6. Conclusions	28
3. Per Capita Financing of Education in Estonia	33
3.1. Introduction	33
3.2. Background	34
3.3. The Design of the Funding Formula	36
3.4. The Implementation of the Funding Formula	53
3.5. Assessment of Outcomes	60
3.6. Conclusions	82
Annex A. Additional Statistics	87
Annex B. List of People Interviewed for the Country Case Study	98
4. School Vouchers in Georgia: Implementation of a Simple Idea in a Complex Environment	101
4.1. Introduction	101
4.2. Background	102
4.3. The Design of the Funding Formula	110
4.4. The Implementation of the Funding Formula	115
4.5. Assessment of Outcomes	120
4.6. Conclusions	127

5. Student Basket Reform in Lithuania: Fine-Tuning Central and Local Financing of Education.....	133
5.1. Introduction.....	133
5.2. Background	135
5.3. The Design of the Funding Formula.....	141
5.4. The Implementation of the Funding Formula.....	151
5.5. Assessment of Outcomes.....	170
5.6. Conclusions	177
Annex A. Methodology of Student Basket	182
Annex B. Complete Table of Allocation Coefficients for Student Basket in 2007... 189	
Annex C. List of People Interviewed for the Country Case Study	192
6. Per Capita Financing of General Education in Poland: A Case Study.....	198
6.1. Introduction.....	198
6.2. Background	199
6.3. The Design of the Funding Formula.....	204
6.4. The Implementation of the Funding Formula.....	212
6.5. Assessment of Outcomes.....	222
6.6. Conclusions	238
Annex A. Additional Statistics on School Funding	242
Annex B. List of People Interviewed for the Country Case Study	249
7. Per Capita Financing of General Education in Russia: An Assessment of the Financing Reform in the Chuvash Republic and the Tver Oblast.....	252
7.1. Introduction.....	252
7.2. Background	253
7.3. The Design of the Funding Formula.....	255
7.4. The Implementation of the Funding Formula.....	257
7.5. Assessment of Outcomes.....	264
7.6. Conclusions	272
Annex A. Factors Influencing the Implementation of PCF in 72 Regions.....	275
Annex B. List of People Interviewed for the Country Case Study	277
8. Per Capita Financing of General Education in Europe and Central Asia: Has It Delivered on Its Promise? An Overview of Six Country Case Studies ...	280
8.1. Introduction.....	280
8.2. Different Objectives of Per Capita Finance Reform in ECA—But in the Context of Decentralization.....	280
8.3. Great Variation in Design, Structure, Coverage and Reach of Funding Formulae	284
8.4. Assessing the Reform: What is the Evidence?.....	289
8.5. Main Lessons Learned	300
Annex A. Per Capita Financing Formulae: A Comparative Analysis.....	302

Boxes

Box 1.1. What is Decentralization?	5
Box 3.1. The Funding of Private Schools in Estonia	42
Box 3.2. Per Student Funding: Efficiency Effects on Private Schools in Estonia	67
Box 3.3. A Look at the Effects of the Financing Reform on Quality: Equality of Outcomes in Estonia	79
Box 5.1 Teacher Qualifications and Salaries in Lithuania	169
Box 6.1. Non-Public Schools in Poland: Federation of Educational Initiatives.....	229
Box 8.1. To Pilot or not to Pilot? Issues in Introducing the Per Student Finance Reform.....	290

Figures

Figure 1.1. Decline in the Proportion of School-Age Population in Selected ECA Countries: 1990-2004	2
Figure 2.1. Per Student Expenditures by School: Historical Input-based (1999) vs. Formula-based (2000) Allocations.....	14
Figure 2.2. Formula-Based Per Student Unit Cost by School Size, 1999-2007.....	17
Figure 2.3 Kotayk Region: Budgets vs. Actual Expenditures by School, 2006 (consolidated picture).....	23
Figure 2.4 Kotayk Region: Budgets vs. Actual Expenditures by School, 2006 (breakdown of key portions of picture).....	24
Figure 3.1. Number of Schools and Student Enrolments: 1980 to 2005.....	35
Figure 3.2. Education Grant as a Proportion of Total Municipal Education Expenditure, 2005	53
Figure 3.3. Education Expenditure as a Proportion of Municipal Total Expenditure, 2005	54
Figure 3.4. Municipalities: Sources of Revenue, 2005	54
Figure 3.5. Municipal Tax Revenues Before and After Equalization Grant, 2008.....	55
Figure 3.6. Percentage Change in Students Enrolled in Grades 1 to 12, 2006 Compared with 1992.....	61
Figure 3.7. New Formula (2008): How Per Student Allocation Varies with Number of Students per Grade	71
Figure 3.8. Average Salaries Compared: Teacher vs. Other Workers, 2006.....	72
Figure 3.9. Distribution of Municipal Tax Revenues Per Student, 2005.....	74
Figure 5.1 Student Basket Allocation to Initial Schools as a Function of Student Numbers	163
Figure 5.2. Per Class Allocation for Grades 1 to 4 by Class Size	166
Figure 5.3. Average Per Class Allocation by Class Size	166
Figure 5.4 Average Class Sizes and Actual Student Basket Allocation Per Student.....	167
Figure 5.5. Average Class Sizes and Actual Per Class Student Basket Allocation.....	168
Figure 6.1. Number of Schools by Type.....	224
Figure 6.2. Primary Schools in Poland by Size	225
Figure 6.3. Student-Teacher Ratio (Full-Time Teachers) and Average Class Size.....	226

Figure 6.4. Distribution of Current Expenditure Per Student in <i>Gminas</i> in 2005.....	232
Figure 6.5. Subvention for Education as a Proportion of Total Expenditure on Education in 2005	232
Figure 6.6. <i>Gminas</i> ' Per Capita Income.....	233
Figure 7.1. Chuvash Republic: Per Student Normatives—Urban vs. Rural Schools, 2001-2007 (at nominal and 2001 prices).....	260
Figure 7.2. Cheboksary Municipality: Per Student Education Budget—Regional Subvention and Municipal Budget (at 2004 prices).....	260
Figure 7.3. Tver Oblast: Diversions from the Per Student Normatives, by Municipality	262
Figure 7.4. Tver Oblast: School Budget Adjustment Coefficients Applied by Municipalities.....	263
Figure 7.5. Cheboksary Municipality: Number of Students and Teachers—2001/02-2006/07	265
Figure 7.6. Cheboksary Town: Per Student Wages and Salaries by School—2004-2007 (at 2004 prices)	266
Figure 7.7. Vishny Volochek Municipality: Per Student Unit Cost Relative to the Normatives by School, 2006-2007.....	268
Figure 7.8. Zubtsov Municipality: Per Student Indicators by School—2004-2007 (at 2004 prices)	270

Tables

Table 2.1. Key Events in Education Financing Reforms in Armenia	15
Table 2.2. PCF Participating and Non-Participating Schools and Protected Schools.....	16
Table 2.3. Number of Protected Schools by Year and by Region	16
Table 2.4. Per Student Unit Cost and Fixed Cost for the PCF formula, 1999-2007 in Armenian Dram (AMD).....	17
Table 2.5. Key Statistics of General Education Schools: 2001-2007	19
Table 2.6. Key Statistics of General Education Schools: 2001-2007: PCF, Protected and Non-PCF Schools	21
Table 2.7. Distribution of General Education Schools by Size, 2001 and 2006	22
Table 2.8 Indicative Average Monthly Salaries (incl. Benefits), in AMD.....	26
Table 2.9. Indicative Average Monthly Salaries (incl. Benefits) for School Directors and Deputy Directors, in AMD	27
Table 2.10. Indicative Average Monthly Salaries (incl. Benefits) for Teachers by Categories, in AMD.....	27
Table 3.1. Summary of Key Events in Estonian General Education: 1989 to 2008.....	34
Table 3.2 General Education Grant: 2003 to 2007	39
Table 3.3. Per Student Coefficients in the Funding Formula in 2007.....	40
Table 3.4. Number of Students by Category, 2006	40
Table 3.5. Additional Factors in the Per Student Funding Formula	41
Table 3.6. Grants for General Education to Municipalities by Type of Grant, 2007	42
Table 3.8. Minimum Number of Students Needed to Bring in Sufficient Funds to Pay for Teaching Costs.....	46

Table 3.7. Calculation of Per Student Funding Amount.....	46
Table 3.9. Additional Funding in Stages I to III for Small and Under-sized Full Classes.....	47
Table 3.10. Additional Funding for Grades 1 to 6 with Fewer than 7 Students.....	48
Table 3.12. Allocation for School Directors and Deputies.....	49
Table 3.11. Funding for Additional Lessons and for Enhanced Costs.....	49
Table 3.13. Allocation of State Education Grant to Sub-categories of Grant, 2008.....	51
Table 3.14. Case-Study Municipalities: Descriptive Statistics.....	56
Table 3.15. Tallinn City: Formula for Determining the Part of the Municipal Budget Allocation that Goes to Schools, 2007.....	58
Table 3.16. Tallinn City: Method of Allocating State Budget for Teaching.....	59
Table 3.17. Number of Schools, by Type: 1992-2006.....	61
Table 3.18. Distribution of Public Schools by Size Categories: 1992 to 2006 (Percentage of Total).....	62
Table 3.19. Average Class Size in Estonian Public Schools: 2000-2004.....	62
Table 3.20. Student-Teacher Ratio in Estonian Public Schools: 1990-2006.....	63
Table 3.21. Tallinn City: Distribution of Schools by Size (Percentage of Total), Selected Years.....	63
Table 3.22. Tallinn City: Classes and Students in the Two <i>Gymnasium</i> Schools, 2007.....	64
Table 3.23. Tallinn City: Distribution of General Education Expenditure by Category, Selected Years.....	68
Table 3.24. Municipalities' Education Expenditure Per Student and Fiscal Burden on Residents, 2005.....	75
Table 3.25. Determinants of Education Expenditure Per Student, by Type of Municipality, 2005.....	76
Table 3.26. Comparison of Per Student Expenditure in 7 Schools in 4 Municipalities, 2007.....	78
Table 3.27. Estonian National Test: 2006 Results (Average Student Marks).....	79
Table 3.28. Constraints and Flexibilities in the Estonian School Funding System.....	83
Table A1. Calculation of State Grant for Funding a School in a Municipality with Less Than 1600 Students in Each Language Medium, according to the 2008 formula.....	87
Table A2. Numbers of schools in Estonia, 1981 to 2006.....	89
Table A3.1. Budget of Prangli Basic School (2007).....	90
Table A3.2. Budget of Viimsi Secondary School (2007).....	91
Table A3.3. Budget of Juri Gymnasium School (2007).....	92
Table A3.4. Budget of Mustvee Russian Gymnasium School (2007).....	93
Table A3.5. Budget of Mustvee Estonian Gymnasium School (2007).....	94
Table A3.6. Budgets of Tallinn's Gymnasium Schools: School 21 and Russian Gymnasium (2007).....	95
Table 4.1. Timeline of Key Events Related to the Education Finance Reform.....	102
Table 4.2. Number of Schools, by School Size.....	106
Table 4.3. Number of Students, by School Size.....	106
Table 4.4. Change in the Average Size of Schools.....	107

Table 4.5. Number of Teachers, by School Size	107
Table 4.6. Student-Teacher Ratio, by School Size.....	108
Table 4.7. Average Number of Teaching Hours per Week per Teacher, by School Size.....	108
Table 4.8. FTE Teachers, by School Size	109
Table 4.9. Students per FTE Teacher, by School Size.....	109
Table 4.10. Administration Staff, by School Size.....	110
Table 4.11. Administration Staff per School, by School Size	110
Table 4.12. Values of the Vouchers in Successive Years.....	112
Table 4.13. Values of the Vouchers in Successive Years as Percentage of City Voucher	113
Table 4.14. Number of Schools in 2006, 2007, 2008, by Size Category and Voucher Type.....	113
Table 4.15. Number of Students and FTE teachers in 2006/07, by School Size and Voucher Type.....	114
Table 4.16. Number of Non-Teaching Staff in 2006/07, by School Size and Voucher Type.....	114
Table 4.17. Students per FTE Staff in 2006/07, by Size Category and Voucher Type....	115
Table 4.18. Minimum Number of Students per FTE Staff, by Voucher Type.....	117
Table 4.19. Average Value of Student Voucher, by Size Category (in GEL)	117
Table 4.20. Minimum Required Expenditures and Their Coverage by Vouchers, by School Size.....	118
Table 4.21. Required Funding above Voucher, by School Size.....	119
Table 4.22. Average Class Size, by School Size and Voucher's School Location Categories	121
Table 4.23. Average Per Class Allocation, by School Size and Voucher's School Location Categories.....	122
Table 5.1. Timeline of Key Events Related to the Education Finance Reform.....	135
Table 5.2. Students by School Type: 2000 to 2005	136
Table 5.3. Schools by School Type: 2000 to 2005	136
Table 5.4. Students by Instruction Language, Selected School Years	137
Table 5.5. Founders by Type of School.....	137
Table 5.6. Students by Transportation Mode	138
Table 5.7. Expenditures of Teaching Process and Teaching Environment.....	142
Table 5.8. Education as Part of Lithuanian Public Finances (million Lt).....	144
Table 5.9. Education as a Proportion of the GDP, Central, and Local Budgets.....	144
Table 5.10. Structure of Education Spending in Lithuania.....	145
Table 5.11. Revenues of Panevezis Budget, 2006	145
Table 5.12. Expenditures of Panevezis Budget, 2006.....	145
Table 5.13. Structure of the Student Basket: 2002 to 2007	146
Table 5.14. Simplified Structure of the Student Basket: 2002 to 2007	147
Table 5.15. Yearly Rates of Growth of the Student Basket: 2002 to 2007	147
Table 5.16. Major Components of the Student Basket: 2002 to 2007	148

Table 5.17. Size Categories of Schools and Normative Class Size.....	148
Table 5.18. Initial Allocation Coefficient by Size Category and Grade Level.....	149
Table 5.19 Corrected Allocation Coefficient, by Size Category and Grade Level.....	149
Table 5.20. Per Student Allocation to Municipalities 2003 to 2007.....	154
Table 5.21. Student Basket Grant and Expenditures on Teaching Process (Thousands Lt.).....	155
Table 5.22. Municipalities That Contribute Most to the Teaching Process above the Student Basket Grant.....	155
Table 5.23. Non-Salary Elements of the Teaching Process: 2003 to 2006.....	156
Table 5.24. Expenditures on Non-Salary Items in Student Basket Expenditures: 2003 to 2006.....	157
Table 5.25. Incoming and Outgoing Students in Panevezis Municipalities.....	157
Table 5.26. Reallocation of Student Basket Funds by Municipalities: 2003 to 2006.....	159
Table 5.27. Average School Sizes by School Type 2000 to 2005.....	161
Table 5.28. Allocation Thresholds for Initial Schools.....	163
Table 5.29. Allocation Thresholds for Basic Schools.....	164
Table 5.30. Allocation Thresholds for Full Secondary Schools.....	164
Table 5.31. Initial Per Class Allocation by Size Category and Grade Level.....	165
Table 5.32. Corrected Per Class Allocation by Size Category and Grade Level.....	165
Table 5.33 Salary Coefficients of Lithuanian Teachers, 2002 and 2007.....	169
Table 5.34 Distribution of Teachers by Career Level, 2002 and 2007.....	169
Table 5.35 Student-Teacher Ratios in Lithuanian General Education Schools ⁷¹	171
Table 5.36. Private Schools: 2000 to 2005.....	177
Table 5.37. Value of Factors Used to Calculate the Basic Student Basket Amount.....	182
Table 5.38. Teaching Student Basket Coefficient: 2002 to 2007.....	184
Table 5.39. Non-Teaching Student Basket Coefficient: 2002 to 2007.....	184
Table 5.40. Complete Student Basket Coefficient: 2002 to 2007.....	185
Table 5.41. Stipulated Structure of the Student Basket: 2002 to 2007.....	186
Table 5.42. Stipulated Structure of the Average Student Basket: 2002 to 2007.....	187
Table 5.43. Official Lithuanian Allocation for Teacher Professional Development: 2002 to 2007.....	187
Table 5.44. Adjusted Structure of the Average Student Basket: 2002 to 2007.....	188
Table 5.45. Coefficients for Allocation of Student Basket (From January 1, 2007).....	190
Table 6.1. Summary of Key Events in Polish General Education, 1989 to 2005.....	200
Table 6.2. Total Amount of Subvention for Education, 2000-2007.....	209
Table 6.3. Kwidzyn <i>Gmina</i> : Education Budget 2006.....	212
Table 6.4. Annual Per Student Funding of Each School in Kwidzyn (2007).....	214
Table 6.5. Kwidzyn City <i>Gmina</i> : Number of Pupils, 1998 to 2006.....	215
Table 6.6. Kwidzyn City <i>Gmina</i> 's Schools: Teaching and Non-Teaching Posts.....	215
Table 6.7. Kwidzyn City <i>Gmina</i> : Students and Classes at <i>Gimnazjum 2</i>	216
Table 6.8. Kwidzyn City <i>Gmina</i> : Budget for <i>Gimnazjum 2</i> (2007).....	217
Table 6.9. Czosnów <i>Gmina</i> : Education Expenditure and Budget Revenue.....	218

Table 6.10. Czosnów <i>Gmina</i> : The Composition of Total Teachers' Salaries (2006)	219
Table 6.11. Czosnów <i>Gmina</i> : Total Actual Expenditures of Schools (2006)	220
Table 6.12. Czosnów <i>Gmina</i> : Student Rolls, 2001/2 to 2006/7	221
Table 6.13. Staffing Ratios at Czosnów Schools Compared to Kwidzyn Ones (2007)...	221
Table 6.14. Comparison of Per Student Expenditure in Czosnów and Kwidzyn (2007)	222
Table 6.15. Educational Expenditure per Student (Primary and Lower Secondary) in <i>Gminas</i> in 2005, in zł.....	231
Table 6.16. Factors Explaining Current General Education Expenditure Per Student in Different Type of <i>Gminas</i>	234
Table 6.17. Constraints and Flexibilities in the Polish School Funding System.....	239
Table 6.18. Shares of the Education Subvention by School and Student Type in 2000 ...	242
Table 6.19. Kwidzyn's Subvention for 2007 Determined by the Formula	243
Table 6.20. Kwidzyn: Calculating Part A of the Voucher	245
Table 6.21. Czosnów's Subvention for 2007 Determined by the Formula	247
Table 7.1. Key Events in Education Financing Reforms in Russia	254
Table 7.2. Adjustment Coefficients by Level of Education.....	257
Table 7.3. Adjustment Coefficients by Type of Class (Educational Program).....	257
Table 7.4. Chuvash Republic: Adjustment Coefficients, 2003 and 2007	259
Table 7.5. Tver Oblast: School Education Budget—Total for 43 Municipalities.....	262
Table 7.6. Tver Oblast: School Statistics—Total for 43 Municipalities.....	269
Table 8.1. Policy Objectives of Per Capita Financing in Case Study Countries.....	281
Table 8.2. Details of Per Capita Financing Formulae: Main Features.....	286
Table 8.3. Details of Per Capita Financing Formulae: Adjustment Factors.....	287