Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) and Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) in South Africa

A case study of German Transnational Corporations

Tatjana Chahoud Maren Keller Kristof Krahl Jakob Rieken Vera Riffler Jana-Lisa Wendering

Contents

Abbreviations

Summary		
1	Introduction	23
1.1	Objective and scope of the report	23
1.2	Research methodology, data collection / analysis and methodological limits	24
1.3	Design of the report	25
2	Socio-economic background in South Africa	26
2.1	Historical and political development background: From apartheid to post-apartheid in the RSA	26
2.2	Socio-economic structures of today's South Africa	28
3	Overcoming economic apartheid: Approaches to Affirmative Action, compulsory regulation and voluntary commitment	30
3.1	Affirmative Action	31
3.1.1	Formal and substantive equality	31
3.1.2	Historical, constitutional and legislative foundations	32
3.2	Taking Affirmative Action in the private sector: The interplay of legal compulsion and voluntary	2.4
	commitment	34
3.2.1	Embedded "Affirmative Actors", TNCs and the place of CSR/BBBEE	35
3.2.2	The Affirmative Action regulatory basket	35
3.2.2.	1 A special South African case: CSR, BBBEE and 'soft law'	36
3.2.3	Incentivising corporate engagement and inducing compliance in South Africa	40

4	The regulatory framework, verification and challenges	41
4.1	The structure of the regulatory framework	42
4.1.1	The constitution	43
4.1.2	Codes of Good Practice and scorecards	44
4.1.2.1	Scope	48
4.1.3	Transformation charters and sector codes	49
4.2	Verification and certification	49
4.3	Challenges posed by the BBBEE concept	51
4.3.1	Goals and implications of the BBBEE elements	51
4.3.2	Compatibility with other legal instruments	52
4.3.3	Multinational companies in the context of the	
	ownership element	54
5	BBBEE and CSR: Opportunities and challenges for	
3	stakeholders	56
5.1	Stakeholder mapping: Who is involved in the process and how?	56
5.2	Implementation of BBBEE – How stakeholders perceive companies' and institutions' responsibilities	5 ⁷ 7
5.2.1	Broad-based and sustainable implementation of BEE	58
5.2.2	Addressing loopholes and obstacles to BBBEE	(2)
	implementation	62
5.2.3	Realising the business case of BBBEE and communicating 'win-win' scenarios	64
5.3	The transformation imperative of BBBEE	65
6	CSR and BBBEE – Perception of and contribution by German TNCs operating in South Africa	66
6.1	Company sample	66
6.2	CSR/BBBEE agenda of German TNCs in South Africa	67
6.3	BBBEE scorecards, activities and concerns	68

6.4 Certification process 6.5 Impact of BBBEE on companies 72 6.5.1 Employment structure 73 6.5.2 Benefit-cost ratio 73 6.5.3 Procurement competitiveness 74 6.6 Drivers of BBBEE 75 6.8 Role of other actors 76 6.8.1 Public policy actors 76 6.8.2 Business associations 77 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 78 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 81 81 81 82 84 84 84 84 84 85 86 86 86 87 87 87 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88	6.3.1	Contribution levels of companies	70
6.5 Impact of BBBEE on companies 6.5.1 Employment structure 73 6.5.2 Benefit-cost ratio 73 6.5.3 Procurement competitiveness 74 6.6 Drivers of BBBEE 75 6.7 Shortcomings of BBBEE 75 6.8 Role of other actors 76 6.8.1 Public policy actors 76 6.8.2 Business associations 77 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 78 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 81 81 81 82 84 84 84 84 85 86 86 87 87 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88	6.3.2	Perception of the scorecard weighting scheme	70
6.5.1 Employment structure 6.5.2 Benefit-cost ratio 6.5.3 Procurement competitiveness 74 6.6 Drivers of BBBEE 75 6.7 Shortcomings of BBBEE 75 6.8 Role of other actors 6.8.1 Public policy actors 6.8.2 Business associations 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 81 81 83 84 84 84 85 86 86 86 87 87 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88	6.4	Certification process	71
6.5.2 Benefit-cost ratio 6.5.3 Procurement competitiveness 74 6.6 Drivers of BBBEE 75 6.8 Role of other actors 76 6.8.1 Public policy actors 76 6.8.2 Business associations 77 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 78 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 81 81 82 83 84 84 85 86 86 86 86 87 87 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88 88	6.5	Impact of BBBEE on companies	72
6.5.3 Procurement competitiveness 6.6 Drivers of BBBEE 74 6.7 Shortcomings of BBBEE 75 6.8 Role of other actors 6.8.1 Public policy actors 6.8.2 Business associations 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 78 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 Bibliography 83 Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.5.1	Employment structure	73
6.6 Drivers of BBBEE 6.7 Shortcomings of BBBEE 6.8 Role of other actors 6.8.1 Public policy actors 6.8.2 Business associations 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 6.8.4 Development cooperation 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 Bibliography 83 Appendixes Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.5.2	Benefit-cost ratio	73
6.7 Shortcomings of BBBEE 6.8 Role of other actors 6.8.1 Public policy actors 6.8.2 Business associations 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 6.8.4 Development cooperation 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 Bibliography 83 Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.5.3	Procurement competitiveness	74
6.8 Role of other actors 6.8.1 Public policy actors 76 6.8.2 Business associations 77 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 78 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 83 Appendixes Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.6	Drivers of BBBEE	74
6.8.1 Public policy actors 6.8.2 Business associations 77 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 83 84 85 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86	6.7	Shortcomings of BBBEE	75
6.8.2 Business associations 6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 78 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 83 Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.8	Role of other actors	76
6.8.3 Civil society organisations and trade unions 6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 83 83 84 84 85 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86 86	6.8.1	Public policy actors	76
6.8.4 Development cooperation 78 7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 Bibliography 83 Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.8.2	Business associations	77
7 Concluding remarks and future prospects 79 Bibliography 83 Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 97 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	6.8.3	Civil society organisations and trade unions	78
Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 83 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice	6.8.4	Development cooperation	78
Appendixes Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	7	Concluding remarks and future prospects	79
Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	Bibliography		
Appendix 1: The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98		·	
South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, Section 9 97 Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	Appe	ndixes	
Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice 98	Apper	` •	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			97
Appendix 3: List of stakeholder interviews 99	Appendix 2: Codes of Good Practice		98
	Apper	ndix 3: List of stakeholder interviews	99
·			