

Reforming Severance Pay

AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

Robert Holzmann and Milan Vodopivec
Editors



THE WORLD BANK
Washington, D.C.

Contents

Preface	xi
Acknowledgments	xiii
Abbreviations	xv
1. Severance Pay under Review: Key Issues, Policy Conclusions, and Research Agenda	1
Robert Holzmann and Milan Vodopivec	
Introduction	1
Issues with Severance Pay.....	2
Chapter Overview	5
Conclusions and Proposed Reform Directions.....	8
Research Agenda: Next Steps	11
Notes.....	13
References and Other Resources	13
2. Severance Pay Programs around the World: History, Rationale, Status, and Reforms	17
Robert Holzmann, Yann Pouget, Milan Vodopivec, and Michael Weber	
Introduction: Objectives, Methods, and Structure	17
The Origins of Severance Pay.....	18
Mandated Severance Pay Programs: Modalities, Overview, Reforms	23
The Motivation behind Severance Pay: Reviewing Hypotheses and Evidence.....	43
Conclusions.....	64
Notes.....	66
Annex A. Historic Perspectives across Countries and Regions	68
Severance Pay in the United States.....	68
Severance Pay in the United Kingdom	69
Severance Pay in Japan.....	70
Origins of Severance Pay in Developing and Transitional Countries	70
Annex B. Inventory of Severance Pay across the World	75
Annex C. Note on Econometric Estimation.....	111
Why Robust Regression?	111
Summary of Critical Aspects	111
References and Other Resources	113

3. Mandated Severance Pay and Firing Cost Distortions: A Critical Review of the Evidence	121
Donald O. Parsons	
Introduction	121
Severance as Job Displacement Insurance: An Overview	123
Severance Policies and Outcomes: Theoretical Structure	127
Government Reforms: A Policy Taxonomy	129
An Early Cross-National Study: A Bold Empirical Adventure	131
Extending the Dismissal Policy Vector: Heckman-Pagés	132
Employment Protection Legislation: OECD Studies	134
Labor Standards and Their Consequences.....	136
Broad Economic Reforms and Their Consequences	138
Employment Protection Legislation and Worker Separations.....	141
EPL: Employment and Its Distribution	142
EPL as Workplace Control	145
Severance Pay Generosity.....	147
Conclusion	149
Notes.....	150
References.....	153
4. The Firing Cost Implications of Alternative Severance Pay Designs	159
Donald O. Parsons	
Introduction	159
Job Separation Benefits: Some Definitions	160
Severance Insurance and Severance Savings: Consumption-Smoothing and Firing Cost Consequences.....	162
Diversity of Severance Pay Plans in the United States: Firing Cost Implications	163
Individual Programs as Elements of a Policy Bundle	168
Firing Costs: Some International Evidence	169
Conclusion	171
Notes.....	172
References.....	174
5. Effects of the Austrian Severance Pay Reform.....	177
Helmut Hofer, Ulrich Schuh, and Dominik Walch	
Introduction	177
Severance Pay Law in Austria	178
Capital Accumulation and the New Severance Pay Scheme.....	180
Mobility in the Labor Market.....	184
Conclusions.....	190
Notes	192
References.....	193

6. Severance Pay Reform in the Republic of Korea.....	195
Jungyoll Yun and Jai-Joon Hur	
Introduction	195
The Corporate Pension System	197
Theoretical Framework	197
Policy Implications	203
Conclusion	206
Annex A	206
Notes	207
References.....	208
7. Unemployment Insurance Savings Accounts in Latin America: Overview and Assessment	211
Ana M. Ferrer and W. Craig Riddell	
Introduction	211
Potential Advantages of UISAs.....	212
UISAs in Latin America	214
Outcomes of UISAs.....	230
Conclusion	232
Notes.....	233
References and Other Resources	235
8. The Welfare Consequences of Alternative Designs of Unemployment Insurance Savings Accounts	239
Hugo Hopenhayn and Juan Carlos Hatchondo	
Introduction	239
Economic Environment.....	241
The Life-Cycle Model	242
Calibration	243
Benchmark and Other Mechanisms.....	246
Unemployment Insurance Savings Accounts.....	248
Conclusions.....	255
Annex A	256
Notes.....	257
References.....	257
9. The New Chilean Unemployment Insurance System: Combining Individual Accounts and Redistribution in an Emerging Economy.....	259
Solange Berstein, Eduardo Fajnzylber, and Pamela Gana	
Introduction	259
Description of the System.....	260
Design Considerations and Reemployment Incentives	264
Evaluation	267

The 2009 Reform	272
Lessons for Other Countries	276
Conclusions	280
Notes	281
References.....	283
10. Reemployment Incentives under the Chilean Hybrid Unemployment Benefit Program.....	285
Gonzalo Reyes, Jan C. van Ours, and Milan Vodopivec	
The Quest to Reduce Work Disincentives in UI Programs.....	285
Data and Methodology.....	287
Eligibility and Use of the Solidarity Fund.....	289
Empirical Analysis of Job-Finding Rates	290
Conclusions.....	293
Notes.....	293
References.....	294
Contributors.....	295
Boxes	
2.1 Railroad Workers and Severance Pay.....	19
2.2 Severance Pay as Commitment Technology? An Early Example of the Human Resource Management of Severance Pay	21
2.3 Sri Lanka's Severance Pay System	34
2.4 Political Economy Complexities in Reforming Severance Pay Programs	44
A.1 Golden Gate and Bay Bridges—Job Displacement and Severance Pay	69
A.2 Severance Pay in Mexico: Compensation for Liquidated Damages of Job Ownership	72
Figures	
2.1 Incidence of Mandated and Quasi-Mandated Severance Pay Programs	27
2.2 Incidence of Mandated Severance Pay Programs in Sectors	28
2.3 Eligibility Contingencies for Severance Pay (in percent).....	30
2.4 Vesting Periods for Benefit Eligibility (in months)	31
2.5 Severance Pay Generosity by Length of Service	32
2.6 Severance Pay Generosity Index	35
2.7 Funding Methods.....	37
2.8 Taxation Rules.....	38
2.9 Generosity of Severance Pay and per Capita GDP	48
2.10 Unemployment Benefit Generosity and per Capita GDP	50
2.11 Pension Benefit Generosity and per Capita GDP.....	51
2.12 Notice Period (in Weeks) and per Capita GDP.....	52
2.13 Generosity of Severance Pay versus Unemployment Benefit	54
2.14 Generosity of Severance Pay versus Pension Benefit Generosity.....	56
2.15 Severance Pay Generosity and Notice Period.....	57

2.16	Severance Pay Generosity and Union Density.....	58
3.1	Mandated Severance Pay for Redundancy by Occupation.....	126
3.2	Regulating Employment and Business Practices.....	130
3.3	Percentage of Employers with Growth in Employment.....	148
4.1	Eligibility Conditions for Severance Pay, Total and by Organization Size	167
5.1	Proportion of Employees Covered by the 2003 Severance Pay Law	180
5.2	Contributions to Austria's Severance Pay Scheme.....	181
5.3	Performance of Severance Pay Funds	182
5.4	Withdrawals from Employee Benefit Funds.....	183
5.5	Job Duration Estimates, Female and Male	191
7.1	Liquidity of FGTS.....	220
7.2	Financing the Chilean Unemployment System	221
7.3	Colombian Severance Pay Fund Portfolio	225
7.4	Rate of Return for Panama's Unemployment Funds.....	228
8.1	Pareto Set, low salary, baseline case	251
8.2	Pareto Set, medium salary, baseline case.....	251
8.3	Pareto Set, high salary, baseline case.....	252
8.4	Pareto Set, low salary	253
8.5	Pareto Set, medium salary.....	253
8.6	Pareto Set, high salary.....	254
9.1	Unemployment Insurance Coverage	262
9.2	Unemployment Insurance Program: Workers with Open-Ended Contracts.....	263
9.3	Unemployment Insurance Program: Workers with Fixed-Term Contracts.....	263
9.4	Contributors by Type of Contract and Wage Earners in the Private Sector, 2002–09 (number of contributors and number of workers).....	268
9.5	Beneficiaries' Replacement Rates, 2002–June 2009	269
9.6	Unemployment Funds, Net Worth, 2002–June 2009	270
9.7	Estimated Median Benefit from the UI System, by Education and Age.....	271
9.8	Hazard Rates from Not Contributing, by Type of Benefit Received	273
10.1	Exit Rates and Survival Rates, Prime-Age Males	290
10.2	Exit Rates and Survival Rates, Prime-Age Female.....	291

Tables

2.1	Drivers of Generosity of Severance Pay: Results for Basic Model.....	60
3.1	Expected Cost of Alternative Labor Market Mandates	133
3.2	Estimated Impacts of Alternative Labor Market Mandates on Employment Levels	133
4.1	Severance Benefit Generosity by Occupation, Organizations with Plan Based on Service Only	164

4.2	Basis of Severance Calculations by Occupation, Organizations with Plan Not Based on Service Only	165
5.1	Simulations of the Severance Pay Funds.....	184
5.2	Job Tenure.....	185
5.3	Probability of Job Termination in Year 3 and Year 4.....	186
5.4	Probability of Job Termination by Gender in Year 3 and Year 4.....	187
5.5	Probability of Direct Job Change in Year 3 and Year 4	187
5.6	Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Job Termination.....	188
5.7	Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Job Termination by Gender	189
5.8	Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Direct Job Change.....	189
5.9	Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Direct Job Change by Gender.....	190
5.10	Effect of Reform	191
6.1	Severance Pay System versus Corporate Pension System.....	198
6.2	Number of Workers under Corporate Pension System as of November 2010	205
7.1	UISA Characteristics.....	216
7.2	FGTS, Number and Value of Accounts	219
7.3	Payments of Chilean Unemployment Insurance.....	222
7.4	Chilean Unemployment Fund	223
7.5	Evolution of the Colombian Fund	226
7.6	Severance Payments in Panama.....	227
7.7	Composition of Panama's Unemployment Fund.....	228
7.8	Analysis of Funds.....	230
8.1	Mean of Variables for Transitions from Employment to Unemployment and Vice Versa.....	245
8.2	Maximum Likelihood Estimates of Logistic Regressions	245
8.3	Cost of Insurance Mechanisms for Different Transfer Schemes and Different Costs of Exerting Effort	247
8.4	Cost of Effort	249
8.5	Marginal Cost of Effort in the Baseline Case.....	250
8.6	Marginal Cost of Effort for Alternative Designs.....	255
9.1	Valuation of Unemployment Insurance by Education Level.....	272
10.1	Eligibility and Use of the Solidarity Fund by Number of Potential Withdrawals from the Individual Account.....	289