

2015-2016

Evaluating and Rewarding the Quality of Teachers

INTERNATIONAL PRACTICES



Table of Contents

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	9
CHAPTER 1 EVALUATING AND REWARDING GOOD TEACHERS	11
The importance of quality teachers	13
Examples of teacher evaluation systems	14
Challenges in linking rewards to evaluation	15
Importance of evaluation and rewards in attracting and retaining quality teachers	16
Salary compensation and links to evaluation	18
• Problems with the single salary schedule	18
Overview and contributions of up-coming chapters	20
References	24
CHAPTER 2 A REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL PRACTICE	29
Financial incentives	30
• Incentives for teacher education	30
Incentives based on teacher's knowledge and skills	31
• Evaluation of teacher performance	31
Incentives for teaching in shortage subject areas	34
Incentives for teaching in schools in difficult environments	34
Other financial incentives	37
Incentives based on performance in the classroom measured by student results on external examinations	38
Non-financial incentives	41
Evidence of effectiveness	44
Evaluations of national and state/regional programmes	44
• Experimental studies of incentives	49
Annex 2A: Incentives in education	52
References	60
CHAPTER 3 DESIGN COMPONENTS OF INCENTIVE PAY PROGRAMMES IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR	65
Introduction	66
Incentive structure	67
• Rank-order tournaments	67
• Fixed performance contract	68
Unit of accountability	71
• Individual unit of accountability	71
• Group unit of accountability	72
• Hybrid models of accountability	74

Performance measures	75
• Educational inputs	75
• Educational outputs	79
• Multiple measures – linking educational inputs and outputs	82
Performance standards and thresholds	83
• Linear models	83
• Step functions	83
• Limited linear models	84
• Threshold levels	85
Size and distribution of bonus awards	85
• Size of bonus	85
• Distribution of award	87
• Non-monetary incentives	88
Payout frequency	89
Cultural considerations	90
Conclusion	91
References	94
CHAPTER 4 WHOSE INCENTIVES? WHOSE STIMULI? PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT IN ENGLAND	103
Introduction	104
<i>Incentives and stimuli: performance management and performance-related pay</i>	104
<i>Incentives and stimuli: teachers’ continuing professional development</i>	111
<i>Incentives and stimuli: school leadership</i>	115
<i>Evaluation and assessment: the need to differentiate its purposes – a footnote</i>	117
<i>The need for dialogue between teacher organisations and governments on school improvement</i>	118
<i>References</i>	119
CHAPTER 5 EXPLORING THE USE OF INCENTIVES TO INFLUENCE THE QUALITY AND DISTRIBUTION OF TEACHERS	121
Why focus on teachers?	122
Salary schedules and the incentives that exist now	124
Using incentives: technical and practical considerations	127
Evidence on purposeful teacher incentive systems	137
Conclusion: infrastructure to support incentive systems	140
<i>References</i>	144
CHAPTER 6 INCENTIVE SYSTEM IMPLEMENTATION	151
Stakeholder engagement and communication strategies are essential to successful compensation reform initiatives	153
• A range of communication strategies is needed for different purposes and different audiences	153
• Stakeholder engagement helps to ensure programmes reach consensus on core purposes and create a unified vision for the plan	153
• Stakeholder engagement efforts help to ensure the system will be accepted and lead to desired results	154

Potential consequences if educators are not engaged in the formation of policies on compensation	154
• Educators may purposely design pay plans so that rewards are unattainable.	154
• Teachers may vote to withdraw from the compensation programme.....	155
Desirable practices in communication and stakeholder engagement	155
• Create a representative compensation reform committee.....	155
• Build support for the reform effort	158
Lessons learnt	161
Developing a feedback loop and making mid-course corrections	163
How different countries and localities engage teachers and their unions in the development of incentive systems	163
Conclusion	166
References	167
CHAPTER 7 PROFESSIONAL EDUCATORS AND THEIR PAY: POLICY, IMPLEMENTATION AND ALIGNMENT ISSUES	169
Overview of key educator pay issues: stabilising costs and raising student achievement.....	170
Education reform strategies and their results to date	173
Educator compensation reform possibilities	174
Considerations in the design and implementation of performance pay programmes.....	177
The influence of federal, state, district and school contexts	178
Cultivating a culture of continual appraisal and mid-course corrections	181
Components of high-quality performance pay programmes	182
21 st century educator pay for performance plans: permanent professional practices or ephemeral policy propositions?	183
Iron triangles, high politics, political champions, and transaction costs	183
Positioning performance pay on the political continuum	184
The political valence of how performance pay is practically portrayed	185
The potentially powerful, but unpredictable, impact of research experiments and experience	186
The path ahead	187
Systemic integration and alignment: the surest way to performance pay survival	187
Conclusion	191
Annex 7A: Practical preparation for performance pay programme implementation	192
References	197
CHAPTER 8 THE POLITICS OF PERFORMANCE-BASED INCENTIVES IN EDUCATION: AN INTERNATIONAL LOOK	199
A sharp break: the management of teachers' work.....	201
Unions as political actors.....	202
Internal balancing act.....	208
Research: the devil is in the details	209
Conclusion	210
References.....	213

CHAPTER 9 PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER	217
Key design issues	219
• Prerequisite conditions	219
• For evaluation	221
Design decisions	222
Key implementation issues	232
• Design of a pilot programme to test design	232
• Creation of an evaluation plan	233
• Alignment of compensation plan with system improvement plans	234
• Identification of “champion” for the plan	235
• Regular communication with stakeholders	235
• Development of broad political support	235
Training of school leaders and teachers	236
Revisions in plan from pilot results	237
• Full implementation	238
Conclusion	239
References	240