Critical Tax Theory

AN INTRODUCTION

Edited by

L . _-

Anthony C. Infanti University of Pittsburgh School of Law

> **Bridget J. Crawford** Pace University School of Law



Contents

, **A**

List of Illustrations	page xiii
List of Tables	xiv
List of Contributors	xv
List of Common Abbreviations	xix
Introduction	xxi
CHAPTER 1. FOUNDATIONS OF CRITICAL TAX THEORY	1
Sexism in the Code: A Comparative Study of Income Taxation of Working Wives and Mothers Grace Blumberg	3
CHAPTER 2. HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON TAXATION	r 11
Dollars and Selves: Women's Tax Criticism and Resistance in the 1870s Carolyn C. Jones	13
Split Income and Separate Spheres: Tax Law and Gender Roles in the 1940s Carolyn C. Jones	22
The Rhetoric of the Anti-Progressive Income Tax Movement: A Typical Male Reaction Marjorie E. Kornhauser	28
CHAPTER 3. THE GOALS OF TAX POLICY	. 39
Racial Equality in the Twenty-First Century: What's Tax Policy Got to Do with It? Dorothy A. Brown	42
Discursive Deficits: A Feminist Perspective on the Power of Technical Knowledge in Fiscal Law and Policy Lisa C. Philipps	46

viii Contents	
The Hidden Costs of the Progressivity Debate Nancy C. Staudt	53
Tax Equity Anthony C. Infanti	60
Tax Policy and Feminism: Competing Goals and Institutional Choices Anne L. Alstott	65
CHAPTER 4. CRITICAL TAX THEORY MEETS PRACTICE	73
A Legislator Named Sue: Re-Imagining the Income Tax Marjorie E. Kornhauser	75
Using the Social Background Model to Explain Who Wins Federal Appellate Tax Decisions: Do Less Traditional Judges Favor the Taxpayer? Daniel M. Schneider	82
Tax Protest, "A Homosexual," and Frivolity: A Deconstructionist Meditation Anthony C. Infanti	88
Sisters in Law: Gender and the Interpretation of Tax Statutes Gwen Thayer Handelman	95
Deconstructing the Duty to the Tax System: Unfettering Zealous Advocacy on Behalf of Lesbian and Gay Taxpayers Anthony C. Infanti	100
CHAPTER 5. RACE AND TAXATION	1 07
Tax Counts: Bringing Money-Law to LatCrit Alice G. Abreu	109
A Black Critique of the Internal Revenue Code Beverly I. Moran and William Whitford	116
The Marriage Bonus/Penalty in Black and White Dorothy A. Brown	125
Tax and Race: The Impact on Asian Americans Mylinh Uy	130
Race and Equality Across the Law School Curriculum: The Law of Tax Exemption David A. Brennen	137
Race and Class Matters in Tax Policy Dorothy A. Brown	144

Contents	ix
CHAPTER 6. GENDER AND TAXATION	153
Not Color- or Gender-Neutral: New Tax Treatment of Employment Discrimination Damages Karen B. Brown	155
Taxing Housework Nancy C. Staudt	162
The Marital Deduction QTIP Provisions: Illogical and Degrading to Women Wendy C. Gerzog	170
A Taxing Woman: The Relationship of Feminist Scholarship to Tax Marjorie E. Kornhauser	176
CHAPTER 7. SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND TAXATION	183
Same-Sex Couples and the Federal Tax Laws Patricia A. Cain	185
The Internal Revenue Code as Sodomy Statute Anthony C. Infanti	192
Heteronormativity and Federal Tax Policy Nancy J. Knauer	200
Death Taxes: A Critique from the Margin Patricia A. Cain	208
<i>Homo Sacer</i> , Homosexual: Some Thoughts on Waging Tax Guerrilla Warfare Anthony C. Infanti	215
CHAPTER 8. THE FAMILY AND TAXATION	221
Love, Money, and the IRS: Family, Income-Sharing, and the Joint Income Tax Return Marjorie E. Kornhauser	224
Innocent Spouses: A Critique of the New Tax Laws Governing Joint and Several Tax Liability Lily Kahng	231
Taxation and the Family: A Fresh Look at Behavioral Gender Biases in the Code Edward J. McCaffery	239
The Profits and Penalties of Kinship: Conflicting Meanings of Family in Estate Tax Law Bridget J. Crawford	246

x Contents	
The Tax Treatment of Children: Separate but Unequal Dorothy A. Brown	254
Rocking the Tax Code: A Case Study of Employment-Related Child-Care Expenditures Mary Louise Fellows	261
CHAPTER 9. CLASS AND TAXATION	269
Women, Poverty, and the Tax Code: A Tale of Theory and Practice Michael A. Livingstori	270
The Working Poor Are Paying for Government Benefits: Fixing the Hole in the Anti-Poverty Purse Francine J. Lipman	276
Welfare by Any Other Name: Tax Transfers and the EITC Dennis J. Ventry, Jr.	283
Race, Class, and the Internal Revenue Code: A Class-Based Analysis of <i>A Black Critique of the Internal Revenue Code</i> Wilton B. Hyman	290
CHAPTER 10. DISABILITY AND TAXATION	299
Tax and Disability: Ability to Pay and the Taxation of Difference Theodore P. Seto and Sande L. Buhai	300
Enabling Work for People with Disabilities: A Post-Integrationist Revision of Underutilized Tax Incentives Francine J. Lipman	308
Disability and the Income Tax David G. Duff	316
CHAPTER 11. GLOBAL CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON TAXATION	323
Toward a Global Critical Feminist Vision: Domestic Work and the Nanny Tax Debate Taunya Lovell Banks	326
The Taxation of Undocumented Immigrants: Separate, Unequal, and Without Representation Francine J. Lipman	334
Prying Open the Closet Door: The Defense of Marriage Act and Tax Treaties Anthony C. Infanti	341
Missing Africa: Should U.S. International Tax Rules Accommodate Investment in Developing Countries? Karen B. Brown	348
	The Tax Treatment of Children: Separate but Unequal Dorothy A. Brown Rocking the Tax Code: A Case Study of Employment-Related Child-Care Expenditures Mary Louise Fellows CHAPTER 9. CLASS AND TAXATION Women, Poverty, and/the Tax Code: A Tale of Theory and Practice Michael A. Livingstof The Working Poor Are Paying for Government Benefits: Fixing the Hole in the Anti-Poverty Purse Francine J. Lipman Welfare by Any Other Name: Tax Transfers and the EITC Dennis J. Ventry, Jr. Race, Class, and the Internal Revenue Code: A Class-Based Analysis of <i>A Black Critique of the Internal Revenue Code</i> Wilton B. Hyman CHAPTER 10. DISABILITY AND TAXATION Tax and Disability: Ability to Pay and the Taxation of Difference Theodore P. Seto and Sande L. Buhai Enabling Work for People with Disabilities: A Post-Integrationist Revision of Underutilized Tax Incentives Francine J. Lipman Disability and the Income Tax David G. Duff CHAPTER 11. GLOBAL CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON TAXATION Toward a Global Critical Feminist Vision: Domestic Work and the Nanny Tax Debate Taunya Lovell Banks The Taxation of Undocumented Immigrants: Separate, Unequal, and Without Representation Francine J. Lipman Prying Open the Closet Door: The Defense of Marriage Act and Tax Treaties Anthony C. Infanti Missing Africa: Should U.S. International Tax Rules Accommodate Investment in Developing Countries?

Contents	xi
Global Trajectories of Tax Reform: The Discourse of Tax Reform in Developing and Transition Countries Miranda Stewart	354
CHAPTER 12. CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON CRITICAL TAX THEORY	363
Redistributive Justice and Cultural Feminism William J. Turnier, Pamela Johnston Conover, and David Lowery	364
Taking Critical Tax Theory Seriously Lawrence Zelenak	371
A Feminist Perspective on the QTIP Trust and the Unlimited Marital Deduction Joseph M. Dodge	381
Caring Enough: Sex Roles, Work, and Taxing Women Amy L. Wax	385
Index	389