

---

# Working Together

COLLECTIVE ACTION, THE  
COMMONS, AND MULTIPLE  
METHODS IN PRACTICE

*Amy R. Poteete*

*Marco A. Janssen*

*Elinor Ostrom*

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS  
PRINCETON AND OXFORD

# Contents

---

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	xiii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
<i>Prologue</i>	xxi

## PART ONE: *Introduction*

### CHAPTER ONE

Overcoming Methodological Challenges	3
<i>Social Science Debates over the Superiority of Particular Methods</i>	7
<i>Multiple Methods: Promises and Challenges</i>	11
<i>Practical Challenges and Methodological Trade-Offs</i>	14
Technological Development and the Costs of Border Crossing	15
Availability and Accessibility of Data	17
<i>Career Incentives as Methodological Constraints</i>	18
Training	19
Career Incentives and Specialization	20
<i>Our Substantive Focus</i>	21
Interactions between Theory and Methods	23
Multiple Methods and Collaborative Research	23
Practical Constraints on Methodological Choices	23
Career Incentives and Methodological Practice	24
<i>Outline of the Book</i>	24

## PART TWO: *Field Methods*

### CHAPTER TWO

Small-N Case Studies: Putting the Commons under a Magnifying Glass	31
<i>The Conventional Theory of the Commons</i>	31
<i>The Case Study Method</i>	33
Cases, Case Studies, and Case Study Research	33
Analytical Strengths and Weaknesses	34
Practical Considerations	37
<i>Synthesizing Challenges and Coordinating New Research Efforts</i>	39
<i>Contributions to the Study of the Commons</i>	45
Property Rights and Tenure Security	45

Group Characteristics	52
Resource Characteristics	57
<i>Case Studies as a Foundation</i>	60
CHAPTER THREE	
Broadly Comparative Field-Based Research	64
<i>Methodological Practices over Fifteen Years of Research</i>	65
Defining the Units of Analysis	66
Trading Geographic Scope for Numbers?	68
Theoretical Aspirations and Methodological Practices	74
<i>Practical Challenges to Broadly Comparative Field-Based Research</i>	74
Costs of Data Collection	75
Research Design and Sampling	76
The Implications of Data Scarcity and Costliness	78
<i>Meta-Analysis: An Introduction</i>	78
Weighing the Benefits and Costs of Meta-Analysis	81
Coding Strategies and Missing Data	81
Potential Sources of Sample Bias	83
<i>The Choice of Methodological Strategy: Weighing Costs against Control</i>	86
CHAPTER FOUR	
Meta-Analysis: Getting the Big Picture through Synthesis	89
<i>Meta-Analysis: A Recapitulation</i>	89
<i>The Common-Pool Resource (CPR) Research Program</i>	90
Defining Variables	92
Compensating for Gaps in Case Materials	93
Contributions	94
Overall Assessment	101
<i>NIIS: A Hybrid Approach</i>	102
Adaptation of the CPR Protocols	103
Measurement and Sampling	104
Contributions	105
Overall Assessment	107
<i>Other Synthetic Studies</i>	107
Additional Examples of Meta-Analysis	108
An Example of Narrative Synthesis	111
<i>Progress and Continuing Challenges</i>	113
CHAPTER FIVE	
Collaborative Field Studies	115
<i>Collaboration in Field-Based Research, 1990–2004</i>	116
<i>Two Research Partnerships</i>	118

Community-Based Management of Common-Pool Resources in Tanzania	118
Traditional Management of Artisanal Fisheries in Nigeria	120
Thoughts about Research Partnerships	124
<i>CGIAR: A Global Research Alliance</i>	124
<i>IFRI: An International Research Network</i>	126
Strategies for Data Collection	127
Strategies for Coordination	128
Contributions and Challenges	129
<i>Comparing the Strategies and Drawing Implications</i>	132

### PART THREE: *Models and Experiments in the Laboratory and the Field*

#### CHAPTER SIX

Experiments in the Laboratory and the Field	141
<i>The Experimental Method</i>	142
<i>Laboratory Experiments of Relevance to the Study of the Commons</i>	144
Public Goods Experiments	146
Common-Pool Resource Experiments	150
<i>Insights from Public Goods and Common-Pool Resource Experiments in the Laboratory</i>	153
Face-to-Face Communication in the Laboratory	153
Heterogeneity	156
Sanctioning Experiments	158
<i>Field Experiments</i>	159
<i>Toward a New Generation of Experiments of Commons Dilemmas</i>	163
New Developments in Laboratory Experiments	164
Toward a New Generation of Field Experiments	168
<i>Conclusion</i>	169

#### CHAPTER SEVEN

Agent-Based Models of Collective Action	171
<i>A Brief Introduction to Agent-Based Modeling</i>	171
Cellular Automata	172
Networks	173
Agents	174
Strengths and Weaknesses of Agent-Based Models	175
<i>Repeated Prisoner's Dilemma</i>	177
Cooperation among Egoists	177
Evolving Strategies in Prisoner's Dilemma Tournaments	178
<i>Spatial Games</i>	180

Spatial Social Dilemma Games	180
Spatial Public Goods Games	181
<i>Indirect Reciprocity</i>	182
<i>Evolution of Costly Punishment</i>	185
<i>Evolution of Social (Meta) Norms</i>	187
<i>Future Challenges</i>	188
<i>Conclusion</i>	191
 CHAPTER EIGHT	
Building Empirically Grounded Agent-Based Models	194
<i>Comparing Simulations with Data</i>	195
<i>Different Approaches to Combine Empirical Data and Agent-Based Models</i>	196
<i>Agent-Based Models of Laboratory and Field Experiments</i>	198
<i>Role Games and Companion Modeling</i>	204
<i>Models of Case Studies</i>	207
<i>Methodological Challenges</i>	210
<i>Conclusion</i>	212
 PART FOUR: <i>Synthesis</i>	
 CHAPTER NINE	
Pushing the Frontiers of the Theory of Collective Action and the Commons	215
<i>Synopsis of Research Developments Reviewed in Parts II and III</i>	217
<i>Toward a More General Behavioral Theory of Human Action</i>	220
Assumptions of a Behavioral Theory	222
The Centrality of Trust	226
<i>Unpacking the Concept of Context</i>	227
<i>The Microsituational Context</i>	228
The Impact of Microsituational Variables on Cooperation	228
The Challenge of Linking Contextual Scales	231
<i>The Broader Scale Affecting Collective Action</i>	232
Ontological Frameworks	233
An Ontological Framework of Social-Ecological Systems	234
Predicting Self-Organization Drawing on the SES Framework	236
Diagnosing Institutional Change	239
<i>Challenges for Future Research</i>	243
<i>Conclusion</i>	245
 APPENDIX 9.1: A Theoretical Puzzle: Why Do Some Resource Users Self-Organize and Others Do Not?	 246

## CHAPTER TEN

Learning from Multiple Methods	248
<i>Interlocking Developments in Methods and Theory</i>	249
<i>Methodological and Disciplinary Cross-Fertilization and Theoretical Innovation</i>	251
Sequential Movement between Methods and Disciplines	252
Combining Multiple Methods and Disciplines in a Program of Research	255
Spaces for Cross-Fertilization	257
<i>Practical Challenges</i>	258
Trade-Offs in Training and Research	258
Professional Incentives	260
<i>Collaborative Research as a Collective-Action Problem</i>	262
Rewards to Individual and Collaborative Research	263
Fragmentation of Academia	265
Misunderstandings and Mistrust	266
Long-Term Funding	269
Responding to the Challenges	270
<i>Looking Forward</i>	271
 <i>Notes</i>	 275
<i>References</i>	289
<i>Index</i>	339