

Frank Müller-Langer

# **Creating R&D Incentives for Medicines for Neglected Diseases**

An Economic Analysis of Parallel Imports,  
Patents, and Alternative Mechanisms  
to Stimulate Pharmaceutical Research

With a foreword by Prof. Dr. Hans-Bernd Schäfer



**RESEARCH**

## Detailed Contents

<i>Foreword</i> .....	<i>VII</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i> .....	<i>IX</i>
<i>Summary Contents</i> .....	<i>XI</i>
<i>Detailed Contents</i> .....	<i>XIII</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i> .....	<i>XVII</i>
<i>List of Figures and Tables</i> .....	<i>XIX</i>
<b>1. Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1. The Malaria Case.....	4
<b>2. The TRIPS Agreement and Access to Patented Medicines</b> .....	<b>7</b>
2.1. Introduction.....	7
2.2. Standards.....	9
2.2.1. Patent Protection under the TRIPS Agreement.....	10
2.2.1.1. Patentable Products and Processes.....	10
2.2.1.2. Disclosure.....	11
2.2.1.3. Rights Conferred.....	12
2.2.1.4. Compulsory Licenses and Parallel Imports.....	12
2.3. Enforcement of IPRs under the TRIPS Agreement.....	20
2.3.1. General Provisions regarding Enforcement Procedures.....	20
2.3.2. Civil Judicial Procedures and Remedies under the TRIPS Agreement..	20
2.3.3. Provisional Measures under the TRIPS Agreement.....	22
2.3.4. Border Measures under the TRIPS Agreement.....	23
2.3.5. Criminal Procedures under the TRIPS Agreement.....	24
2.4. Dispute Settlement.....	24
<b>3. Economic Analysis of Patents</b> .....	<b>28</b>
3.1. Introduction.....	28
3.2. Underlying Economic Theory.....	29
3.2.1. The Economics of Patents.....	29
3.2.1.1. The Monopoly/Innovation Tradeoff.....	29
3.2.1.2. Patent Races.....	31
3.2.1.3. Property Rights and the Tragedy of the Anticommons.....	46
3.2.2. Optimal Patent Design: Duration, Breadth and Depth of Patents.....	62
3.2.2.1. Duration of Patents.....	62
3.2.2.2. Breadth of Patents.....	73
3.2.2.3. Patents and Cumulative Innovation.....	79
3.2.3. Private Enforcement of Patents and Remedies for Infringement.....	83
3.2.4. Enforcement of Patents and Patent Litigation.....	85

3.2.5.	The Pharmaceutical Market.....	86
3.2.5.1.	Overview of the Pharmaceutical Industry .....	86
3.2.5.2.	The Economics of Drug Development and Pricing.....	87
<b>4.</b>	<b>Patent Protection in the Developing World .....</b>	<b>98</b>
4.1.	Introduction.....	98
4.2.	Microeconomic Theory as to Patent Protection in the .....	
	Developing World .....	99
4.2.1.	Global Patent Protection and its Impact on Economic Welfare .....	99
4.2.1.1.	Innovation in a Closed Economy.....	100
4.2.1.2.	Multiple Inventions in an Open Economy with two Countries.....	111
4.2.2.	Patent Protection and North-South Trade.....	126
4.2.3.	International Patent Agreements and International Harmonization of.....	
	Patent Protection.....	126
4.2.3.1.	Optimal Patent Policy in a Closed Economy.....	127
4.2.3.2.	Optimal Patent Policies in a World Economy .....	127
4.3.	Empirical Evidence regarding Patent Protection.....	
	in the Developing World .....	130
4.3.1.	Empirical Evidence regarding the Underinvestment in R&D for .....	
	Medicines for Neglected Infectious and Tropical Diseases .....	130
4.3.1.1.	Empirical Evidence regarding R&D for Medicines for Neglected .....	
	Infectious and Tropical Diseases from 1975 to 1996.....	131
4.3.1.2.	Empirical Evidence regarding R&D for Medicines for Tropical .....	
	Diseases from 1975 to 2002 .....	133
4.3.2.	Short-Term Welfare Effects of Global Patent Protection in .....	
	Pharmaceuticals .....	134
4.3.3.	International Redistribution of Income Associated with the.....	
	Implementation of the TRIPS Agreement.....	136
4.3.3.1.	Comment on McCalman (2001).....	139
<b>5.</b>	<b>Legal and Economic Analysis of Parallel Imports .....</b>	<b>140</b>
5.1.	Introduction.....	140
5.2.	Parallel Trade and the Pricing of Pharmaceutical Products in a .....	
	Double Marginalization Game .....	141
5.2.1.	Introduction.....	141
5.2.2.	Legal Framework regarding Parallel Trade.....	144
5.2.2.1.	Parallel Trade and the WTO.....	145
5.2.2.2.	Parallel Trade in the EU .....	146
5.2.2.3.	National Legal Frameworks regarding Parallel Trade .....	148
5.2.3.	Literature on Parallel Trade and R&D for Pharmaceuticals .....	150
5.2.3.1.	Determinants of Parallel Trade.....	150
5.2.3.2.	Dynamic Effects of Parallel Trade on the Investment in R&D.....	154
5.2.4.	Double Marginalization Game with Complete Information .....	156
5.2.4.1.	The Model.....	156
5.2.4.2.	Analysis .....	158
5.2.4.3.	Effects of Parallel Trade Freedom on Profits, Consumer Surplus, .....	
	National and Global Welfare .....	168

5.2.4.4.	Conclusion as to the Model of Parallel Trade and the Pricing of Pharmaceutical Products.....	188
5.3.	Parallel Trade of Pharmaceutical Products in the Context of..... National Price Regulation.....	189
5.3.1.	Model of Parallel Trade with a Price Cap and a Quantity Limit.....	190
5.3.2.	Analysis of the Model of Parallel Trade with a Price Cap and a Quantity Limit .....	192
5.4.	Parallel Trade and the Availability of Patented Pharmaceutical Products in the Developing World .....	196
<b>6.</b>	<b>Solutions for the Problem of Underinvestment in R&amp;D for..... Medicines for Neglected Infectious and Tropical Diseases.....</b>	<b>200</b>
6.1.	Introduction.....	200
6.2.	Insufficient Market Size and Low Expected Market Returns .....	201
6.2.1.	Impact of Market Size on Innovation .....	201
6.2.2.	Pharmaceutical R&D and Low Expected Market Returns in the..... Developing World .....	202
6.2.3.	Impact of Patent Protection on the Domestic Pharmaceutical Industry..... in the Developing World .....	203
6.3.	Push Programs and R&D for Neglected Infectious Diseases.....	204
6.3.1.	Publicly-Funded Research Institutions .....	205
6.3.2.	Targeted R&D Tax Credits.....	207
6.3.3.	Conclusion as to Push Programs .....	210
6.4.	Pull Programs and R&D for Neglected Infectious Diseases .....	211
6.4.1.	Prizes.....	211
6.4.1.1.	Advantages of Prizes .....	212
6.4.1.2.	Disadvantages of Prizes.....	213
6.4.2.	Patent Buyouts .....	215
6.4.2.1.	Description of the Patent Buyout Mechanism.....	215
6.4.2.2.	Advantages of Patent Buyouts.....	216
6.4.2.3.	Disadvantages of Patent Buyouts .....	217
6.4.2.4.	Conclusion as to Patent Buyouts .....	218
6.4.3.	Orphan Drugs.....	219
6.4.4.	Advanced Purchase Commitments .....	221
6.4.4.1.	Advantages of Advanced Purchase Commitments.....	221
6.4.4.2.	Disadvantages of Advanced Purchase Commitments .....	222
6.4.4.3.	Conclusion as to Advanced Purchase Commitments .....	224
6.4.5.	Conclusion as to Pull Programs.....	225
6.5.	Parallel Trade and Medicines for Neglected Infectious Diseases .....	227
6.6.	Conclusions and Policy Recommendations.....	228
<b>7.</b>	<b>Conclusion and Ideas for Further Research .....</b>	<b>231</b>
<i>Appendix</i>	.....	235
<i>Bibliography</i>	.....	249
<i>Index</i>	.....	283