

Uncertainty Handling in Multi-Attribute Decision Support for Industrial Risk Management

von
Valentin Bertsch



universitätsverlag karlsruhe

Contents

List of Figures	v
List of Tables	ix
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Decision Support for Industrial Risk Management	2
1.1.1 Industrial Risks	2
1.1.2 Multi-Criteria Aspects of Industrial Risk Management	4
1.1.3 Uncertainties in Decision Processes	5
1.1.4 Risks in the Energy Sector	6
1.2 Objectives and Structure of the Thesis	8
2 Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis	11
2.1 Purpose and Scope of MCDA	12
2.2 Multi-Attribute Value Theory	14
2.2.1 Steps in a MAVT Analysis	15
2.2.2 Interpretation of MAVT as a Weighted Norm	24
2.3 Multi-Attribute Utility Theory	28
2.3.1 Steps in a MAUT Analysis	29
2.3.2 Bayesian Decision Analysis	38
2.4 Summary	41

3	Simulation-Based Uncertainty Analysis	43
3.1	Classification and Treatment of Uncertainties	44
3.2	Data Uncertainty	51
3.2.1	Modelling and Propagation of Data Uncertainties	51
3.2.2	Visualisation of Data Uncertainties	52
3.2.3	Principal Component Analysis (PCA)	55
3.3	Parameter Uncertainty	62
3.3.1	Multi-Dimensional Inter-Criteria Sensitivity Analysis	65
3.3.2	Multi-Dimensional Intra-Criteria Sensitivity Analysis	68
3.3.3	Visualisation of Parameter Uncertainties	71
3.3.4	Principal Component Analysis (PCA) for Parameter Uncertainties	74
3.4	Combined Consideration of Data and Parameter Uncertainties	77
3.4.1	Integration of the Simulation Based Approaches for Parameter Uncertainties into MAUT	78
3.4.2	Combined Consideration of Data and Parameter Uncertainties in the PCA Plane	82
3.5	Summary	83
4	Decision Support for Nuclear Emergency and Remediation Management	85
4.1	Background and General Setting	86
4.1.1	Events at Nuclear Installations	86
4.1.2	Moderated Workshops	87
4.2	RODOS	89
4.2.1	The Conceptual Structure	90
4.2.2	Data Assimilation and Uncertainties in RODOS	91
4.2.3	Economic Consequence Modelling in RODOS	94
4.2.4	Web-HIPRE	96

4.2.5	The Explanation Module	97
4.3	A Hypothetical Case Study	100
4.4	A Moderated Workshop	103
4.4.1	Problem Structuring	105
4.4.2	Preference Elicitation	107
4.4.3	Selected Results	110
4.5	Uncertainty Modelling for the Case Study	115
4.5.1	Data Uncertainty Modelling	115
4.5.2	Preferential Uncertainty Modelling	118
4.6	Results for the Case Study	120
4.6.1	Visualisation of Results for Deterministic Values	120
4.6.2	Results Taking Data Uncertainties into Account	123
4.6.3	Results Taking Preferential Uncertainties into Account	128
4.6.4	Combined Analysis of Data and Parameter Uncertainties in the Context of the Case Study	137
4.7	Summarising Discussion of the Case Study	139
5	Conclusions and Outlook	143
5.1	Conclusions for Industrial Risk Management	143
5.2	Conclusions Concerning the Multi-Criteria Approach	145
5.3	Outlook	147
5.3.1	Sequential Decision Making	147
5.3.2	Indirect Consequence Assessment and Cascading Effects	151
6	Summary	153
	Bibliography	157
A	The Explanation Module	177

A.1	Content Determination	178
A.2	Discourse Planning	178
A.3	Sentence Generation	180
A.3.1	Statistical Comparisons	181
A.3.2	Sensitivity Analysis	182
A.4	A Step Towards Explaining the Results of Multi-Dimensional Sensitivity Analysis	185
B	Additional Data and Statistical Tests for the Case Study	189
B.1	Data Uncertainty Underlying the Calculations of the Case Study	189
B.2	A Statistical Test for the Data of the Case Study	200
B.2.1	Procedure of the W Test	200
B.2.2	Application of the W Test to the Data of the Case Study	201
