

WORLD BANK ENVIRONMENT PAPER NUMBER 14

Costs, Benefits, and Farmer Adoption of Agroforestry

Project Experience in Central America and the Caribbean

**A CATIE-IFPRI-World Bank Project
Funded by UNDP**

Dean Current, Ernst Lutz, and Sara Scherr, editors

✓
173

SUB Göttingen 7
206 474 806



97 B 4157

**The World Bank
Washington, D.C.**

CONTENTS

FOREWORD IX

ABSTRACT XI

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS XV

CONTRIBUTORS XVI

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS XVII

GLOSSARY XVIII

1. ADOPTION OF AGROFORESTRY 1

Dean Current, Ernst Lutz, and Sara J. Scherr

Evolution of Agroforestry in Central America and the Caribbean 2

Methodology for the Study 4

Characteristics of Projects Reviewed 5

Household Benefits from Agroforestry 8

Agroforestry Adoption Patterns and Implications for Extension 15

Conclusions 19

Annex to Chapter 1 22

2. ECONOMIC ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY SYSTEMS: THE FARMERS' PERSPECTIVE 28

Sara J. Scherr

Introduction 28

Methodological Challenges for Economic Analysis of Agroforestry 28

Economic Factors Influencing Farmers' Decisions To Practice Agroforestry 31

Methods Used in the Case Studies 36

Suggested Directions for Future Work 43

3. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF PROJECTS PROMOTING ON-FARM TREE PLANTING IN COSTA RICA 45

Dean Current

- Agroforestry Efforts in Costa Rica 46
- Description of Projects Selected for Analysis 48
- Analysis of Projects' Agroforestry Systems 49
- Appendix to Chapter 3: Financial Analysis of Traditional Agroforestry Systems on Farms in the Humid Tropics of Costa Rica, by Hernández Auerbach 71

4. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN EL SALVADOR 81

Carlos Reiche C.

- Agroforestry Support Project to Rural Communities with Scarce Resources 82
- Community and Family Nursery Project 87
- Conclusions 92

5. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN GUATEMALA 96

Otto Samayoa Urrea

- Overview of Agroforestry Efforts 97
- Analysis of Two Projects 99
- Objectives of the Agroforestry Systems 101
- Patterns of Farmer Adoption of Agroforestry 102
- Economic Analysis of Agroforestry Systems 106
- Financial Analysis of Agroforestry Systems 108
- Conclusions 111

6. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN HONDURAS 114

Carlos Rodríguez Estrada

- Overview of Agroforestry Efforts 114
- Broad-Leaved Forestry Development Project 117
- COHASA: I Rural Project 122
- LUPE Project 126
- General Findings 131

7. AN ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN NICARAGUA 132

Rodolfo Jesús Vieto Morales

- Agroforestry Efforts In Nicaragua 133
- Erosion Control Project in the Western Region and Reforestation of the Maribios Mountain Ranges 134
- Support Project to Farm Forestry Activity in León and Rehabilitation of the Windbreak System 136
- La Esperancita Farm Project 140

8. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN PANAMA 146

Manuel Gómez

Summary of Agroforestry Efforts	146
The INRENARE/CARE Project	149
The MIDA/WFP Project	153
Key Findings from the Projects	161

9. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC 163

Abel Hernández

Agroforestry Systems	163
Enda-Caribe Project	164
The Floresta Project	171

10. ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF AGROFORESTRY PROJECTS IN HAITI 176

Jon L. Jickling and Thomas A. White

Policy Context for Agroforestry	176
Agroforestry Practices	178
Pan American Development Foundation (PADF) Project	182
Save the Children Federation/Maissade Project	185
Conclusions	190

BIBLIOGRAPHY 195

APPENDIX: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS AT REGIONAL WORKSHOP 210 (FUNDED BY UNDP'S SPECIAL COOPERATION PLAN FOR CENTRAL AMERICA [PEC] PROGRAM)

LIST OF TABLES

2.1	Economic Analysis of Agroforestry from the Farmers' Perspective	32
2.2	Data Collection Methods Used in the Case Studies	38
2.3	Summary of Analysis of PRODAF Project in Puriscal, Costa Rica	40
3.1	Agroforestry Projects and Activities in Costa Rica	47
3.2	Major Agroforestry Systems Found in Costa Rica	48
3.3	Description of the Study Areas and Projects	50
3.4	Opportunities for Improving Agroforestry Systems in Hojancha	52
3.5	Benefit-Cost Analysis of Selected Tree-Planting Systems in Centro Agrícola Cantonal of Hojancha	54
3.6	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for Centro Agrícola de Hojancha	55
3.7	Characteristics of Participating Farms and Plantings	56
3.8	Opportunities for Improving Agroforestry Systems in the Cantons of Tilarán and Abangares	58

3.9	Financial Indicators for Windbreak Systems in Tilarán	60
3.10	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for Tilarán/COPELDOS	61
3.11	Characteristics of Participating Farms	62
3.12	Characteristics of Farms Surveyed in Puriscal	63
3.13	Opportunities for Improving Agroforestry Systems in Puriscal	64
3.14	Financial Indicators for the PRODAF Project in Puriscal	67
3.15	Financial Analysis of Agrosilvopastoral System	67
3.16	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for Projects in Puriscal	68
3.17	Characteristics of Adopting Farms	69
A3.1	Average Plot Sizes and Distribution Among Agrosilvopastoral Activities	74
A3.2	Financial Indicators for Traditional and Introduced Systems in Baja Talamanca	78
A3.3	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for Agroforestry Systems in Baja Talamanca	79
4.1	Agroforestry Projects in El Salvador, 1985-96	83
4.2	Summary of the Agroforestry Project Profile for Communities with Scarce Resources	85
4.3	Financial Indicators for the CENREN/FAO/UNDP Project	88
4.4	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis of the CENREN/FAO/UNDP Project	89
4.5	Summary of the Project Profile for Community and Family Nurseries	90
4.6	Financial Indicators for Community Nurseries Project	93
4.7	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for Community Nurseries Project	94
5.1	Overview of Selected Agroforestry Projects	98
5.2	Summary of the Study Projects	100
5.3	Main Agroforestry Systems Identified	103
5.4	Primary and Secondary Objectives for Adoption of Agroforestry Systems	104
5.5	Benefits of Agroforestry Systems as Indicated by Farmers	108
5.6	Financial Indicators of DIGEBOS/CARE/Peace Corps and Mandeleña Projects	110
5.7	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis	111
6.1	Honduras — The Most Important Agroforestry Projects	116
6.2	Comparative Data on the Projects Studied	118
6.3	Agroforestry Systems Found on the Farms Studied	119
6.4	Rates of the Adoption of Agroforestry Technologies in the Broad-Leaved Forest Development Project	122
6.5	Financial Indicators for the Broad- Leaved Forest Development Project	123
6.6	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis	126
6.7	Financial Indicators for the COHASA and LUPE Projects	128
6.8	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for COHASA and LUPE Projects	129
7.1	Project Summaries	134
7.2	Financial Indicators of Windbreak Rehabilitation Project	139
7.3	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for PROCAFOR	140
7.4	Financial Indicators for La Esperancita	143
7.5	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for La Esperancita	144
7.6	Financial Indicators for La Esperancita 2	144
7.7	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for La Esperancita 2	145
8.1	Principal Forestry and Agroforestry Projects in Panama, 1992	148
8.2	Characteristics of the Two Selected Study Projects	149
8.3	Agroforestry Systems Promoted in the INRENARE/CARE Project	150
8.4	Direct Effects of the INRENARE/CARE Project at the Farm Level	153
8.5	Financial Indicators for the INRENARE/CARE Agroforestry Project	154

8.6	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for the INRENARE/CARE Agroforestry Project	155
8.7	Agroforestry Systems Proposed by the MIDA/WFP Project	156
8.8	Direct Effects of the MIDA/WFP Project at the Farm Level	158
8.9	Financial Indicators for the MIDA/WFP Aquaculture Project	160
8.10	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for MIDA/WFP Project	161
9.1	Principal NGOs Supporting Agroforestry Activities in the Dominican Republic	165
9.2	Financial Indicators for the Enda Caribe Project	170
9.3	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for the Enda Caribe Project	171
9.4	Financial Indicators for the Floresta Project	174
9.5	Sensitivity and Risk Analysis for the Floresta Project	175
10.1	Profitability of Different Land Use Options	184
10.2	Profitability of Different Land Use Options	189

LIST OF MAPS

Location of Selected Agroforestry Projects in:

1.1	Central America	8
3.1	Costa Rica	46
4.1	El Salvador	82
5.1	Guatemala	97
6.1	Honduras	115
7.1	Nicaragua	133
8.1	Panama	147
9.1	The Dominican Republic	164
10.1	Haiti	177