## Causal Causal Causal Causal Asymmetries

Daniel M. Hausman



## **Contents**

| List of Figures                                    | page xii |
|--|----------|
| Acknowledgments                                    | xiii     |
| Introduction: Causation and its Asymmetries        | 1        |
| 1 Metaphysical Pictures and Wishes                 | 4        |
| 1.1 Metaphysical Theories                          | 4        |
| 1.2 The Question                                   | 4        |
| 1.3 How to Begin                                   | 5        |
| 1.4 The Initial Picture                            | 6        |
| 1.5 Wishes   | 7        |
| 1.6 Problems with the Picture                      | 12       |
| 1* Transfer Theories                               | 13       |
| 2 Is Causation a Relation Among Events?            | 18       |
| 2.1 Events   | 19       |
| 2.2 Facts  | 22       |
| 2.3 Is Causation a Relation?                       | 23       |
| 2.4 Causation and Simple Tropes                    | 25       |
| 2.5 Artificial Events and Omissions                | 28       |
| 2.6 Formal Preliminaries                           | 30       |
| 2.6.1 Notation and Terminology                     | 30       |
| 2.6.2 Probability                                  | 31       |
| 2.6.3 Causal Graphs                                | 33       |
| 2.7 What Do Causal Relata Suggest About Causation? | 34       |
| 3 Causation, Regularities, and Time: Hume's Theory | 36       |
| 3.1 Hume's Theory                                  | 36       |
| 3.2 Constant Conjunction                           | 39       |
| 3.3 A Neo-Humean Theory of Causation               | 44       |
| 3.4 Spurious Causation                             | 47       |

| 3.5 Redundant Causation  | 49          |
|--|-------------|
| 3.6 The Problems of Causation                                  | 52          |
| 4 Causation and Independence                                   | 55          |
| 4.1 Causal Connection and Probabilistic Dependency             | 55          |
| 4.2 The Connection Principle                                   | 59          |
| 4.3 A Necessary Condition for Causal Priority                  | 62          |
| 4.4 Independence   | 63          |
| 4.5 Why Believe I?   | 66          |
| 4.6 A Theory of Causal Priority                                | 70          |
| 4.7 Should One Accept the Independence Theory?                 | 71          |
| 4* Causation, Independence, and Causal Connection              | 75          |
| 4.1* The Operationalizing Assumption and the Connection Princ  | iple 75     |
| 4.2* A Necessary Condition                                     | 80          |
| 4.3* Independence Conditions                                   | 81          |
| 4.4* Derivation of CP and Other Results                        | 84          |
| 5 Agency Theory  | 86          |
| 5.1 Formulating an Agency Theory of Causation                  | 87          |
| 5.2 Menzies and Price's Reformulation and Defense              | 89          |
| 5.3 Manipulability and Independence                            | 92          |
| 5.4 Abstract Intervention Theory                               | 95          |
| 5.5 Intervention, Independence, and Causation                  | 96          |
| 5.6 What Role for Agency?                                      | 97          |
| 5* Causal Generalizations and Agency                           | 99          |
| 5.1* Token and Type Causation                                  | - 99        |
| 5.2* Type Causation and Causal Generalizations                 | 101         |
| 5.3* Definitions, Conditions, and Theorems                     | 106         |
| 6 The Counterfactual Theory                                    | 111         |
| 6.1 Lewis's Theory   | 111         |
| 6.2 Asymmetry Without Miracles                                 | 114         |
| 6.3 Why Causes Are Not Counterfactually Dependent on Their E   | Effects 115 |
| 6.4 Counterfactuals and Predictions                            | 118         |
| 6.5 Critique of Lewis's Account of Similarity Among Possible W | orlds 123   |

| 6.6 Refutation of L and Defense of a Restricted Version         | 126 |
|---|-----|
| 6.7 What Does the Counterfactual Theory of Causation Teach Us?  | 128 |
| 6* Independence and Counterfactual Dependence                   | 131 |
| 6.1* Mackie's Counterfactual Theory                             | 131 |
| 6.2* Swain's Theory of Causal Asymmetry                         | 131 |
| 6.3* An Alternative Account of Similarity Among Possible Worlds | 133 |
| 6.4* Independence and Counterfactual Dependence                 | 134 |
| 6.5* The Asymmetry of Overdetermination                         | 136 |
| 6.6* Proof of a Restricted Version of L                         | 137 |
| 7 Counterfactuals, Agency, and Independence                     | 139 |
| 7.1 Agency, Counterfactuals, and Independence                   | 139 |
| 7.2 Agency and Counterfactuals                                  | 141 |
| 7.3 Price Contra Lewis  | 142 |
| 7.4 Irreversibility and Independence                            | 144 |
| 7.5 Reversibility, Intervention, and Independence               | 145 |
| 7.6 Conclusions: Independence, Agency, and Counterfactuals      | 148 |
| 7* Agency, Counterfactuals, and Independence                    | 151 |
| 7.1* Independence and a Token Version of Agency Theory          | 151 |
| 7.2* AT', CP, and L   | 154 |
| 8 Causation, Explanation, and Laws                              | 156 |
| 8.1 The Deductive-Nomological Model and its Sufficiency         | 156 |
| 8.2 Explanatory Asymmetries                                     | 158 |
| 8.3 The Aims of Scientific Explanations                         | 161 |
| .8.4 Causation and Why We Ask, "Why?"                           | 163 |
| 8.5 Causation and Independent Alterability                      | 166 |
| 8.6 Independent Alterability and Explanation                    | 170 |
| 8.7 Explanation, Intervention, Time, and Independence           | 174 |
| 8* Causation, Explanation, and Independent Alterability         | 176 |
| 8.1* Nomic Sufficient Conditions and Explanations               | 176 |
| 8.2* Some Reformulations  | 179 |
| 9.2* Sama Droofs  | 192 |

| 9 Probabilistic Causation  | 185 |
|--|-----|
| 9.1 Causes as Increasing the Probability of Their Effects                | 186 |
| 9.2 Type and Token Causation Revisited                                   | 191 |
| 9.3 Other Difficulties and Refinements                                   | 194 |
| 9.4 What Should One Hold Fixed?  | 197 |
| 9.5 Are Undetermined Events Caused?                                      | 199 |
| 9.6 Probabilistic Causation or Deterministic Causation of Probabilities? | 201 |
| 9.6.1 Three Objections   | 202 |
| 9.6.2 Defense of Taking Probabilistic Causation to Be Deterministic      |     |
| Causation of Probabilities   | 203 |
| 9.6.3 Generalizations Across Inhomogeneous Contexts                      | 204 |
| 9.7 Conclusion: Causation and Determination                              | 205 |
| 10 Causation and Conditional Probabilities                               | 207 |
| 10.1 The Fork Asymmetry  | 207 |
| 10.2 An Asymmetry of Screening-Off?                                      | 208 |
| 10.3 Causal Graphs and Probability Distributions                         | 211 |
| 10.4 Problems with this Account  | 213 |
| 10* Causal Graphs and Conditional Probabilistic Dependencies             | 217 |
| 10.1* Independence Implies Screening-Off                                 | 217 |
| 10.2* Causal Graphs and Probability Distributions – Some Formal Results  | 217 |
| 10.3* Papineau on Failures of Faithfulness                               | 219 |
| 11 Intervention, Robustness, and Probabilistic Dependence                | 222 |
| 11.1 The Asymmetry of Robustness   | 223 |
| 11.2 The Asymmetry of Parameter Independence                             | 224 |
| 11.3 The Asymmetry of Modal Invariance                                   | 228 |
| 11.4 Modal Invariance and Independence                                   | 230 |
| 11.5 Conclusion: Causation and Modularity                                | 231 |
| 11* Interventions and Conditional Probabilities                          | 233 |
| 12 Operationalizing and Revising the Independence Theory                 | 239 |
| 12.1 Do Probabilistic Dependencies Imply Causal Connections?             | 239 |
| 12.2 Do Causal Connections Imply Probabilistic Dependencies?             | 242 |
| 12.3 The Quasi-Reduction of Causality to Probabilistic Dependence        | 244 |

| 12.4 Why One Needs to Know More than Causal Connections and           |     |
|---|-----|
| How to Know It  | 245 |
| 12.5 Operationalizing CP  | 246 |
| 12.6 Lessons from Quantum Mechanics                                   | 247 |
| 12.7 Revising CP  | 252 |
| 12.8 Theories of Causation and Theories of Causal Inference           | 254 |
| 2* Probability Distributions and Causation                            | 255 |
| 12.1* Causation and Causal Connection: A Graphical Exposition         | 255 |
| 12.2* Conditional Probabilities and Probabilistic Dependencies in     |     |
| Possible Worlds   | 256 |
| 12.3* Independence Theory and Statistical Methods of Causal Inference | 258 |
| 12.4* The Revised Independence Theory                                 | 259 |
| 3 Complications and Conclusions                                       | 263 |
| 13.1 Overdetermination  | 263 |
| 13.2 Preemption   | 265 |
| 13.3 Event Fusions  | 268 |
| 13.4 Conclusion: What Is Causation?                                   | 271 |
| Appendix A: Alphabetical List of Propositions                         | 277 |
| Appendix B: List of Theorems  | 282 |
| References  | 285 |
| Index   | 295 |