

# The Justice Motive in Social Behavior

ADAPTING TO TIMES OF SCARCITY AND CHANGE

Edited by  
MELVIN J. LERNER  
and  
SALLY C. LERNER

Technische Hochschule Darmstadt  
Fachbereich 3  
Institut für Psychologie  
Steubenplatz 12, 6100 Darmstadt

*University of Waterloo  
Waterloo, Ontario, Canada*

Inv.-Nr. 9107571

PLENUM PRESS • NEW YORK AND LONDON

Institut für Psychologie TU Darmstadt



56410147

# Contents

## INTRODUCTION

### 1 • Adapting to Scarcity and Change (I): Stating the Problem . . . . 3

*Sally C. Lerner*

1. The Necessary Transition . . . . .	3
2. Tragic Choices in the "Crunch" . . . . .	5
3. Conclusion . . . . .	9
References . . . . .	10

### 2 • The Justice Motive in Human Relations: Some Thoughts on What We Know and Need to Know about Justice . . . . . 11

*Melvin J. Lerner*

1. Setting the Stage for What We Know: A Conceptual Analysis of Justice . . . . .	11
1.1. Some Definitional Properties That Describe What We Have Learned . . . . .	12
1.2. Paradoxical Properties of Justice . . . . .	13
2. What We Thought We Knew about Justice: Justice as an Instrumental Device for Maximizing Outcomes . . . . .	16
2.1. The Appearance of the "Social Contract" and Its Tentative Acceptance . . . . .	16
2.2. Justice as the Expression of Social Power: Contemporary "Equity Theory" . . . . .	17
2.3. Man as a More Rational Animal . . . . .	18
2.4. Common Assumptions and Special Problems in These Perspectives . . . . .	19
3. Need for an Encompassing Theoretical Perspective . . . . .	20
3.1. Justice in Social Institutions . . . . .	20
3.2. Justice as It Defines What Is a "Desired Resource" . . . . .	21

3.3. Centrality of Justice in the Acquisition and Allocation of Resources .....	21
4. What Social-Psychological Processes Could Account for the Way Justice Appears in People's Lives .....	22
4.1. Maturation of Cognitive Processes: The Understanding of "Impersonal Causation" .....	23
4.2. The Basic Templates for Organizing One's View of the World .....	24
5. Examples of the "Emergent Activities": How Justice Appears in Interpersonal Encounters .....	28
5.1. Conditions of Divergent Goals .....	29
5.2. Conditions of Convergent Goals .....	31
5.3. Conditions of Vicarious Dependency .....	32
6. Summary of What We Now "Know" and Need to Know about the Justice Motive in a Complex Society .....	33
References .....	35

## BASIC PROCESSES

<i>Origins and Development of the Sense of Justice</i> .....	39
--	----

3 • Theoretical Issues in the Development of Social Justice .....	41
---	----

*Carolyn H. Simmons*

1. Introduction .....	41
2. Social Learning Theory .....	42
3. Psychoanalytic Theory .....	43
4. Cognitive Developmental Theory .....	43
4.1. Piaget's Perspective .....	43
4.2. Kohlberg's Stages of Moral Reasoning .....	45
4.3. Social Justice and Role-Taking Ability .....	46
4.4. Social Justice and Transformation of Thought .....	46
5. Parity and Equity .....	47
6. Justice Motive Theory .....	48
6.1. The Personal Contract .....	48
6.2. The Social Contract .....	48
6.3. Identity, Unit, and Nonunit Relationships .....	49
7. Questions for Future Study .....	51
7.1. How Early Are Children Capable of Different Types of Justice-Based Decisions? .....	51
7.2. What Range of Responses Are Children Capable of in Expressing Their Ideas of Social Justice? .....	52

7.3. What Are the Effects of Prevalent Strategies in Different Cultures on Children's Social Justice Behavior? .....	52
References .....	53
 4 • The Development of Justice and Self-Interest during Childhood .....	57
<i>William Damon</i>	
1. Introduction .....	57
2. The Development of Children's Hypothetical Reasoning about Justice .....	59
3. Brief Descriptions of Early Positive Justice Levels .....	60
4. Children's Peer-Group Behavior in a Distributive Justice Situation .....	63
5. Description of Further Research .....	71
References .....	72
 5 • Morality and the Development of Conceptions of Justice ....	73
<i>Rachel Karniol and Dale T. Miller</i>	
1. Introduction .....	73
2. Commutative Justice .....	74
2.1. Responsibility and Commutative Justice .....	74
2.2. Authority and Commutative Justice .....	75
2.3. Consistency and Commutative Justice .....	76
3. Distributive Justice .....	78
3.1. Similarity and Distributive Justice .....	78
3.2. Justifying Unequal Distributions .....	79
4. Procedural Justice: Establishing Fair Procedures .....	81
5. Transforming Justice Concerns into Moral and Legal Guidelines .....	82
5.1. Role Taking and Morality .....	83
5.2. Moral Development and Legal Obedience .....	84
5.3. Specious Morality .....	85
6. Summary .....	86
References .....	87
 <i>New Perspectives on the Social Dimensions of Justice</i> .....	91
6 • Social Change and the Contexts of Justice Motivation .....	97
<i>Edward E. Sampson</i>	

1. The Critique of Social Psychology .....	97
1.1. Elements of an Alternative Model .....	99
2. Interpersonal Formulations of Psychological Processes .....	100
2.1. G. H. Mead and L. S. Vygotsky on Mind .....	101
2.2. Mills on Motivation .....	102
2.3. Sullivan on Personality .....	104
3. The Address Frame .....	104
3.1. Literal versus Indexical Meaning .....	106
4. Justice Motivation as Address Frame .....	107
4.1. The Meaning of Justice Motivation as Address Frame ..	107
4.2. The Role of Sociohistorical Factors .....	110
4.3. The Negotiated Quality of Justice .....	111
4.4. The Changing Intelligibility of the Justice Address Frame .....	111
5. Justice and Social Change .....	112
5.1. Particularism versus Universalism .....	113
5.2. A Capsule History .....	114
6. Tension and Dissensus .....	116
6.1. The <i>Bakke</i> Case .....	117
7. Justice Motivation and the Future .....	119
7.1. Beyond Intrapyschology .....	120
8. Scarcity and Justice .....	121
9. Conclusion .....	122
References .....	123
 7 • Retributive Justice .....	 125
<i>Robert Hogan and Nicholas P. Emler</i>	
1. Justice .....	126
2. Distributive Justice .....	128
3. Retributive Justice .....	130
4. Retribution and Equity Theory .....	134
5. The Morality of Retribution .....	138
6. Power, Retribution, and Status .....	141
References .....	142
 8 • The Social Psychology of Punishment Reactions .....	 145
<i>Dale T. Miller and Neil Vidmar</i>	
1. Introduction .....	145
1.1. Definition of Punishment .....	146
2. An Analysis of the Components of Punishment Reactions ..	148

3. Behavior Control .....	149
3.1. Rule and Offense Characteristics .....	151
3.2. Rule Violator Characteristics .....	152
3.3. Individual Differences .....	154
4. Retribution .....	155
4.1. Rule and Offense Characteristics .....	157
4.2. Rule Violator Characteristics .....	159
4.3. Individual Differences .....	163
5. Final Perspective .....	166
References .....	168
 9 • Microjustice and Macrojustice .....	173
<i>Philip Brickman, Robert Folger, Erica Goode, and Yaacov Schul</i>	
1. Introduction .....	173
2. Elements of Microjustice and Macrojustice .....	176
3. Majority Rule and Minority Rights .....	181
4. Lotteries: Macrojustice without Microjustice .....	185
5. The Salience of Microelements and Macroelements in Social Policy Decisions .....	189
6. Directions for Future Research .....	195
Appendix A .....	198
References .....	201

INSTITUTIONAL SETTINGS

<i>Close Relations: Justice, Self-Interest, and Social Bonds .....</i>	205
 10 • The Changing Longevity of Heterosexual Close Relationships: A Commentary and Forecast .....	209
<i>Ellen Berscheid and Bruce Campbell</i>	
1. Introduction .....	209
2. Psychological Antecedents of CR Termination .....	211
2.1. The Direct Effect of External Barriers on Termination Decisions .....	213
3. Recent Social Changes Resulting in Barrier Reduction .....	214
3.1. Reductions in Economic Barriers .....	214
3.2. Reductions in Legal Barriers .....	217
3.3. Reductions in Religious Barriers .....	218
3.4. Reductions in Barriers due to Children .....	218
3.5. Reductions in Social Barriers .....	220
3.6. Summary .....	221

4. The Indirect Effects of Barrier Reduction on Termination Decisions .....	222
4.1. Effects of Barrier Reduction on the Attractiveness of the Relationship .....	222
4.2. Effects of Barrier Reduction on the Number and Attractiveness of Alternatives .....	228
5. Summary and Afterword .....	231
References .....	233
 11 • Giving and Receiving: Social Justice in Close Relationships .....	235
<i>Louise H. Kidder, Michele A. Fagan, and Ellen S. Cohn</i>	
1. Varieties of Justice in Close Relationships .....	235
1.1. Distributive Justice: the Exchange of Resources in Close Relationships .....	236
1.2. Procedural Justice: the Social Power That Accrues to Those Who Have Resources .....	239
2. Men's and Women's Contributions in the World of Work ..	241
2.1. Who Does What Work .....	242
2.2. Which Work Counts .....	243
3. Men's and Women's Contributions in the World of Love ...	244
3.1. Who Gives the Love .....	244
3.2. The Origins of the Division of Labor of Love .....	247
4. Men and Women in Relationships: Different Conceptions of Justice and of Close Relationships .....	248
4.1. Sex Differences in Preferences for Equity or Equality ..	248
4.2. Sex Differences in Close Relationships: An Examination of Homosocial Relationships .....	250
5. A New Order of Intimate Relationships: A Prescription ....	254
References .....	256
 12 • The Exchange Process in Close Relationships: Microbehavior and Macromotives .....	261
<i>John G. Holmes</i>	
1. Introduction .....	261
2. The Development of Macromotives .....	262
3. The Levels-of-Analysis Problem .....	264
3.1. Time Frame Considerations .....	265
4. The Address Frame for Social Evaluation .....	266
4.1. Time Perspectives .....	268

4.2. Explicit, Conditional Exchanges ..... 271

4.3. Resource Equivalence and Substitution ..... 275

4.4. Rule-Governed Behavior ..... 279

5. Conclusion ..... 281

References ..... 282

*Justice in the Marketplace: Allocation of Scarce Resources* ..... 285

13 • The Justice of Distributing Scarce and Abundant Resources 289

*Jerald Greenberg*

1. Introduction ..... 289

1.1. Allocation as a Ubiquitous and Profound Phenomenon 289

1.2. Scarcity: A Neglected Social-Psychological Issue ..... 290

2. Scarcity ..... 291

2.1. Need ..... 293

2.2. Efficiency ..... 297

2.3. Need and Efficiency Interrelated ..... 299

3. Abundance ..... 300

3.1. Review of Experimental Evidence ..... 301

3.2. Abundance-Breeds-Scarcity Paradox ..... 302

4. Special Problems and Issues for Future Research ..... 305

4.1. Self-Enhancing Views of Justice ..... 305

4.2. High Wages Commanded by Scarce Skills ..... 308

4.3. Other Important Considerations ..... 309

4.4. Some Practical Considerations ..... 311

5. Conclusion ..... 312

References ..... 312

14 • The Allocation and Acquisition of Resources in Times  
of Scarcity ..... 317

*Andre deCarufel*

1. Resource Scarcity and the Experience of Deprivation ..... 318

1.1. Unfairly Distributed Scarce Resources ..... 319

1.2. Progressive Deprivation ..... 321

1.3. Aspirational Deprivation ..... 322

1.4. J-Curve Hypothesis ..... 323

1.5. Decremental Deprivation ..... 324

2. Collective Responses to Resource Scarcity ..... 325

2.1. Individual Deprivation and Collective Deprivation .... 326



2.2. Fraternal Deprivation and the Development of Group Cohesiveness .....	327
2.3. Enacting Collective Activity .....	329
2.4. The Aftermath of Collective Action .....	332
3. The Effects of Scarcity on Resource Allocation .....	333
3.1. Self-Interest .....	334
3.2. Justification of the Injustice .....	336
3.3. Substitute Rewards .....	337
3.4. Attention to Procedural Matters .....	337
References .....	339
 15 • Justice in "The Crunch" .....	343
<i>Morton Deutsch</i>	
1. Introduction .....	343
2. Conditions That Affect Coping .....	344
2.1. The Individual's and the Group's Situation prior to the Adversity .....	344
2.2. The Salience of Economic Value in the Individual's and the Group's Eyes .....	345
2.3. The Nature of the Economic Crunch .....	345
2.4. The Causal Attribution of the Crunch .....	346
2.5. The Distribution of the Loss .....	346
2.6. The Constructiveness versus the Destructiveness of the Conflict .....	349
2.7. The Ability to Be Creative .....	352
2.8. The Potential for Mobilization .....	354
2.9. Participation in Decision Making .....	355
3. Conclusion .....	356
References .....	357
 16 • The Relationship of Economic Growth to Inequality in the Distribution of Income .....	359
<i>Thomas D. Cook and Barbara Pearlman</i>	
1. Introduction .....	359
2. The Trickle-Down Theory .....	362
2.1. Overview .....	362
2.2. Assessing the Effectiveness of the Trickle-Down Theory .....	364
2.3. Summary .....	369
3. The Bubble-Up Theory .....	370
3.1. Overview .....	370

3.2. Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the Bubble-Up Strategy .....	373
3.3. Conclusion .....	377
4. Independent Tinkering .....	378
4.1. Introduction .....	378
4.2. Managed Independent Tinkering .....	379
4.3. A "Systems" Approach with "Mindless" Tinkering ....	383
5. Summary and Conclusion .....	385
References .....	388
<i>Legal Institutions and Their Alternatives</i> .....	391
17 • Justice Motives and Other Psychological Factors in the Development and Resolution of Disputes .....	395
<i>Neil Vidmar</i>	
1. Overview .....	395
2. Private Disputes and the Debate over Procedural Alternatives .....	397
3. Justice Motives and Resolution Procedure .....	401
3.1. Justice and Other Motives in Disputes .....	401
3.2. Motives and Forums .....	404
4. Dynamics of the Dispute Process .....	408
4.1. Choice Points in the Dispute Process .....	409
4.2. Theoretical and Practical Implications .....	413
5. Implications and Research Needs .....	416
References .....	419
18 • Down-to-Earth Justice: Pitfalls on the Road to Legal Decentralization .....	423
<i>Robert L. Kidder</i>	
1. Introduction .....	423
2. Scarcity, Centralization, and Neighborhood Justice .....	424
3. Scarcity, Technology, and Decentralization .....	431
4. Conclusion .....	435
References .....	436
19 • Law as a Social Trap: Problems and Possibilities for the Future .....	439
<i>Dean E. Peachey and Melvin J. Lerner</i>	

1. Introduction .....	439
2. Toward an Understanding of the Law .....	440
2.1. A Functional Approach .....	440
2.2. Law as an Effort to Avoid Social Traps .....	442
3. Current Problems in the Legal System .....	443
3.1. Crime Control .....	443
3.2. Dispute Settlement .....	445
3.3. Ensuring Civil Rights .....	445
3.4. Social Engineering: The Law as an Instrument of Social Change and Adaptation .....	447
4. Social Structures as Creators of Social Reality .....	448
4.1. Effect of Surveillance and Rules on Perceived Motivation .....	448
4.2. Loss of a Sense of Personal Control .....	450
4.3. The Illusion of Autonomy and "Diffused Interdependence" .....	450
4.4. The Model of Man Implicit in the Law: Man as a "Rational Animal" .....	451
5. Scenarios of the Future: The Effects of Scarcity .....	453
6. Alternatives .....	455
6.1. Delegalizing Portions of the Law .....	455
6.2. Changes in the Larger Social System .....	456
References .....	458

## ENDNOTE

20 • Adapting to Scarcity and Change (II): Constructive Alternatives .....	465
<i>Sally C. Lerner</i>	
1. The Role of Justice in an Uncertain Future .....	465
2. Toward Institutional Change .....	467
2.1. Education .....	468
2.2. Work .....	470
References .....	472
Author Index .....	473
Subject Index .....	483