

Critical Systems Thinking

Current Research and Practice

Edited by

Robert L. Flood and
Norma R. A. Romm

*University of Hull
Hull, England*

Contents

Overview: A Taste for Research and Practice	1
Part I. Theory	
Commentary	7
<i>Chapter 1</i>	
What Is This Thing Called CST?	11
<i>Gerald Midgley</i>	
1.1. Introduction	11
1.2. Methodological Pluralism	12
1.3. Emancipation	14
1.4. Critical Awareness	14
1.5. Critical Issues	15
1.6. The Ethical Critique of Boundary Judgements	17
1.7. The Implications for Critical Systems Thinking	19
1.8. Conclusion	20
References	22
<i>Chapter 2</i>	
The Ideal of Unity and the Practice of Pluralism in Systems Science	25
<i>Gerald Midgley</i>	
2.1. Introduction	25
2.2. The Ideal of the Unity of Science	26
2.2.1. Early Calls for the Unification of Science	27
2.2.2. Toward an <i>Ideal</i> of Unification	28
2.2.3. Some Initial Conclusions	28
2.3. Manifestations of Isolationism	28
2.3.1. The “Natural” and “Social” Sciences	29
2.3.2. Isolationism and Subject Matter	30
2.3.3. Isolationism in Systems Science	31
2.3.4. Intermediate Conclusions	31
2.4. Toward Pluralism	32
2.5. The Theory of Three Worlds	33

2.6. Conclusion	34
References	35
<i>Chapter 3</i>	
Dealing with Diversity	37
<i>Wendy Gregory</i>	
3.1. Introduction	37
3.2. Strategies for Underpinning Critical Systems Thinking	39
3.2.1. Isolationism	40
3.2.2. Imperialism	40
3.2.3. Pragmatism	41
3.2.4. Pluralism	42
3.3. A Critique of Complementarism Using a “Force Field” Metaphor	45
3.4. Pluralism and the Social Sciences	48
3.5. The “Constellation” Metaphor	49
3.6. Discordant Pluralism	51
3.6.1. The Historical, Local, and Contingent Nature of Discordant Pluralism	52
3.6.2. Discordant Pluralism and Communication	53
3.6.3. Discordant Pluralism and Ethical Judgements	54
3.7. Comparing Complementarism and Discordant Pluralism	56
3.8. Conclusion	58
References	59
<i>Chapter 4</i>	
A Foucauldian Reflection on Critical Systems Thinking	63
<i>Néstor Valero-Silva</i>	
4.1. Introduction	63
4.2. Foucault and the Frankfurt School	64
4.3. Power–Knowledge and the “Critical Ontology of Ourselves”	66
4.3.1. “What is Enlightenment?”	66
4.3.2. Foucault’s Project: The “Critical Ontology of Ourselves”	67
4.3.3. Power–Knowledge	71
4.4. Foucault and Critical Systems Thinking	73
4.4.1. Critical Awareness or “How We Came to Be What We Are”	73
4.4.2. Complementarism: “Critique and Methodology”	74
4.4.3. Emancipation and Improvement	75
4.5. Final Remark	76
References	78
<i>Chapter 5</i>	
Diversity Management: Theory in Action	81
<i>Robert L. Flood and Norma R. A. Romm</i>	
5.1. Introduction	81

Contents	vii
5.2. A Proposal for Complementarism	82
5.3. Ideology-Critique without Absolutes	87
5.4. Addressing Choices	89
5.5. Conclusion	90
References	91
Part II. Methodology	
Commentary	93
<i>Chapter 6</i>	
Total Systems Intervention: Local Systemic Intervention	95
<i>Robert L. Flood</i>	
6.1. Introduction	95
6.2. Ideal Systemic Model of Organisational Dynamics	97
6.3. Principles of LSI	100
6.4. Process of LSI	102
6.4.1. Introduction	102
6.4.2. Critical Review Mode	102
6.4.3. Problem Solving Mode	103
6.4.4. Critical Reflection Mode	112
6.4.5. Three Modes of LSI Revisited	112
6.4.6. Concluding Comments on the Process of LSI	114
6.5. Summary and Conclusion	114
References	115
<i>Chapter 7</i>	
TSI as Critique: The Critical Review Mode	117
<i>Jennifer Wilby</i>	
7.1. Introduction	117
7.2. Summary of TSI	118
7.3. Developing the Critical Review Mode	120
7.3.1. Introduction	120
7.3.2. A Generic Step Model for the Critical Review Mode	121
7.3.3. History of the Six Steps of the Critical Review Mode	123
7.3.4. The Creativity, Choice, and Implementation Subgroups	124
7.4. The Six Steps of the Critical Review Mode	125
7.4.1. Subgroup 1: Creativity/Understanding	126
7.4.2. Subgroup 2: Choice/Categorising	129
7.4.3. Subgroup 3: Implementation/Analysis	132
7.5. Discussion of the Models and the TSI Framework	135
7.6. Discussion	136
References	138

Chapter 8

Critical Creativity and Total Systems Intervention 141

Gillian Ragsdell

8.1. Introduction	141
8.2. Overview	141
8.3. What Is Creativity?	142
8.4. Problem-Solving Approaches and Creativity	150
8.4.1. Introduction	150
8.4.2. Idealised Design	150
8.4.3. Imaginization	151
8.4.4. Nominal Group Technique	152
8.4.5. Informal Creativity	153
8.4.6. Comparison of Approaches	154
8.5. Critical Creativity	156
8.5.1. Introduction	156
8.5.2. Nature of Critical Creativity	157
8.5.3. Principles of Critical Creativity	158
8.6. Principles for Operationalization of Critical Creativity	159
8.6.1. Introduction	159
8.6.2. Critical Review Mode	159
8.6.3. Problem Solving Mode	160
8.6.4. Critical Reflection Mode	160
8.7. Summary	161
References	162

Chapter 9

Critical Systems Thinking for Citizens 165

Werner Ulrich

9.1. Introduction	165
9.2. What Does It Mean to “Pragmatize” Critical Systems Thinking?	166
9.2.1. Pragmatizing Critical Systems Ideas: For Whom and with What Practical Difference in Mind?	166
9.2.2. Some Preliminary Conjectures on the Target Group “Citizens”	168
9.3. What Core Ideas Offer Themselves for Pragmatization?	170
9.4. In What Kind of Context Might Critical Systems Thinking for Citizens Make a Difference?	173
9.4.1. The Importance of the Public Sphere	174
9.4.2. Does Critical Systems Thinking for Citizens Imply an Advocacy Stance? The Methodological Importance (and Ambiguity) of the Emancipatory Interest	175
9.4.3. The Importance and Limitation of Methodology	176
References	177

Chapter 10

Systems Methodologies and Intervention: The Issue of Researcher Responsibility 179

Norma R. A. Romm

10.1. Introduction	179
10.2. Methodology	181
10.3. An Ethic of Responsibility	182
10.4. Three Systems Methodologies: Location of Threats to Responsibility	186
10.4.1. Beer's Cybernetic Approach	186
10.4.2. Checkland and Scholes: Soft Systems Methodology	188
10.4.3. Ulrich's Critical Systems Heuristics	190
10.5. Conclusion	192
References	193

Chapter 11

A Framework for Assessing Participation 195

Mandy Brown

11.1. Introduction	195
11.2. Participative Framework	195
11.2.1. Introduction	195
11.2.2. Purpose of Incorporating Participation	196
11.2.3. Structure and Process of Participation	197
11.2.4. Facilitation of Participation	198
11.2.5. Summary of the Framework	199
11.3. Analysis of Methodologies	199
11.3.1. The Viable System Model	199
11.3.2. Soft Systems Methodology	203
11.3.3. Critical Systems Heuristics	207
11.4. Conclusion	212
References	212

Part III. Practice

Commentary 215

Chapter 12

TSI in North Yorkshire Police: Implementation and Evaluation 217

Robert L. Flood and Philip Green

12.1. Introduction	217
12.2. Context	217
12.3. Procedure	218
12.4. Evaluation of Implementation of LAP	220
12.5. A TSI Appraisal of the Process	223

12.5.1. The LAP Implementation Process in TSI Terms	223
12.5.2. Were the Principles of TSI Upheld?	224
12.6. Conclusion	225
Appendix 1. SAST Exercise with the LAP Steering Committee	225
Appendix 2. Handout Worksheet for Implementation Days	227
Appendix 3. Issues for the Management Team	229
Appendix 4. Evaluation Survey Sheet (for LAP Officers)	232
References	234

Chapter 13

Two Perspectives in a Voluntary Organization	235
<i>Claire Cohen</i>	
13.1. Introduction	235
13.2. The Well Woman Centre and Its Environment	235
13.3. Low Morale and Training	236
13.4. The Two Perspectives	238
13.4.1. The “Cultural Feminist” Perspective	238
13.4.2. The “Bureaucratic” Perspective	240
13.5. Training at the WWC	241
13.6. Searching for a Way Forward: Parameters of a Proposal	242
13.6.1. Survival of Feminism: A Shared Goal	242
13.6.2. Emphasising Power Inequalities	243
13.7. The Structure of the “Debate”	244
13.8. Postscript	247
13.9. Conclusion	249
References	249

Chapter 14

Reflections on an Action Research Project: Women and the Law in Southern Africa	251
<i>Norma R. A. Romm</i>	
14.1. Introduction	251
14.1.1. The Value of Discursive Accountability	252
14.1.2. The Value of Enhanced Choice-Making	253
14.1.3. Critical Systems Thinking: Toward Discursive Accountability and Enhanced Choice-Making	254
14.2. The Case of the WLSA Project	256
14.2.1. Employment of Research Methods to Enhance Dialogical Potential	257
14.2.2. The Relevance of Focus Group Discussions	259
14.2.3. Some Reflections on the Researchers’ “Input” (in the Researching System)	261
14.2.4. Structural Approaches and WLSA	263

14.2.5. The Facilitation of Debate and WLSA	264
14.2.6. Critical Systems Heuristics and WLSA	266
14.2.7. WLSA and CST: A Concluding Comment	269
References	270
<i>Chapter 15</i>	
Economic Recession and Self-Deceptions: Messes in Collective Rationality	273
<i>John Oliga</i>	
15.1. Introduction	273
15.1.1. The Sociopathological Anatomy of Economic Recessions	273
15.1.2. A Critical Hermeneutical Approach	274
15.2. Background to Empirical-Hermeneutical Study	275
15.3. Toward a Hermeneutical Understanding of Economic Crises	276
15.3.1. The Problem of Economic Recession	276
15.3.2. The Consequential Problem of Foreign Competition	278
15.3.3. Long-Wave Theories and Economic Crises	278
15.3.4. Decline in British Competitiveness and Economic Crises	279
15.4. Alternative Interpretations of Economic Crises	282
15.4.1. Global Rise in the Organic Composition of Capital	282
15.4.2. The “Profits Squeeze” Theory	284
15.5. Toward a Critical Understanding of Economic Recession as a Sociopathological Condition	286
15.5.1. Toward a Critical Hermeneutical Understanding	286
15.5.2. Implications for Critical Social Theory	289
15.5.3. Implications for Critical Systems Thinking	294
References	294
Conclusion: Preserving a Taste for Research and Practice without Recipes	297
Index	299