



EVALUATION AND DECISION MODELS WITH MULTIPLE CRITERIA

Stepping stones for the analyst

Denis Bouyssou
CNRS - LAMSADE



Thierry Marchant
Universiteit Gent
m

Marc Pirlot
Faculte Polytechnique de Mons



Alexis Tsoukias
CNRS - LAMSADE



Philippe Vincke
Universite Libre de Bruxelles

4y Springer

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Motivations	1
1.2	What have we learned in the first volume?	4
1.3	Stepping stones for the analyst	6
1.3.1	Structure	7
1.3.2	Outline of the chapters	8
1.3.2.1	Chapter 2	8
1.3.2.2	Chapter 3	10
1.3.2.3	Chapter 4	11
1.3.2.4	Chapter 5	12
1.3.2.5	Chapter 6	13
1.3.2.6	Chapter 7	15
1.4	Intended audience	16
1.5	Who are the authors?	17
1.6	Conventions	17
1.7	Acknowledgements	18
2	Problem formulation and structuring	19
2.1	Decision Aiding Approaches	21
2.2	Decision Processes and Decision Aiding Processes	28
2.2.1	A descriptive model of the decision process	30
2.2.2	Decision Making and Decision Aiding	32
2.3	A model of the Decision Aiding Process	34
2.3.1	The Problem Situation	35
2.3.2	Problem Formulation	37
2.3.3	Evaluation Model	41
2.3.4	Final Recommendation	44
2.4	Problem structuring	46
2.4.1	Problem Structuring Methods	46
2.4.1.1	Cognitive Mapping	46
2.4.1.2	Strategic Choice	47
2.4.1.3	Soft Systems Methodology	48
2.4.1.4	Valued Focussed Thinking	49
2.4.1.5	Integrating Approaches	51
2.4.1.6	Discussion	52
2.4.2	Representing the problem situation	52
2.4.3	Formulating a problem	54

2.4.4	Constructing the Evaluation Model	56
2.4.5	Constructing the final recommendation	60
2.5	Update and Revision: an open problem.	61
2.6	Conclusion.	63
Numbers and preferences		67
3.1	Introduction	67
3.2	Numbers	67
3.3	Four basic examples.	69
3.3.1	The race	69
3.3.2	The weather.	71
3.3.3	The race again.	73
3.3.4	The expert's advice.	75
3.4	Evaluation and meaningfulness.	76
3.4.1	Definitions.	76
3.4.2	Comments.	78
3.5	Stepping stones for this chapter.	79
3.6	Numbers and preference relations.	80
3.6.1	The comparison problem.	81
3.6.2	The numerical representation problem	82
3.6.3	Content of the following sections.	82
3.7	The comparison problem	83
3.7.1	Pointwise evaluations on an ordinal scale.	83
3.7.1.1	Pure ordinal scale	83
3.7.1.2	Ordinal scale with a threshold	85
3.7.1.3	Ordinal scale with two thresholds.	87
3.7.1.4	Ordinal scale with A ; thresholds.	89
3.7.1.5	Ordinal scale with a degree of preference.	90
3.7.2	Pointwise evaluations on an interval scale.	92
3.7.2.1	Pure interval scale.	92
3.7.2.2	Interval scale with a threshold.	94
3.7.3	Pointwise evaluations on a ratio scale.	95
3.7.3.1	Pure ratio scale.	96
3.7.4	Interval evaluations on an ordinal scale.	97
3.7.4.1	Pure ordinal scale	98
3.7.4.2	Ordinal scale with a threshold	100
3.7.5	Interval evaluations on an interval scale.	102
3.7.5.1	Pure interval scale.	102
3.7.5.2	Interval scale with a threshold	103
3.7.6	Summary of the comparison problem	103
3.8	The numerical representation problem.	104
3.8.1	Weak order.	104
3.8.2	Semiorder.	106
3.8.3	Interval order.	111
3.8.4	$(P, Q, /)$ -structure.	113
3.8.5	Valued preference relation.	113

3.9	Conclusion	114
3.10	Appendix: binary relations and ordered sets	115
	Aggregation—Overture	117
4.1	Introduction	117
4.1.1	How can this help the analyst?	119
4.1.2	Organisation of chapters 4-6	120
4.2	Social choice and MCDA	121
4.2.1	Aggregation functions	121
4.2.2	An example: the Borda method	123
4.2.2.1	Axioms and characterisation	123
4.2.2.2	Usefulness of the characterisation	124
4.2.3	Specificity of this approach	126
4.3	Conjoint measurement and MCDA	127
4.3.1	Additive value function	128
4.3.2	Showing tradeoffs	129
4.3.3	Conjoint Measurement	130
4.3.4	Uniqueness issues	131
4.3.5	Relevance of conjoint measurement results for MCDA	133
4.3.6	Marginal preferences within the additive value model	133
4.3.7	Leaning on the additive value model to elicit preferences	135
4.3.8	Tradeoffs or substitution rates	140
4.3.9	The measurement of global preference differences	142
4.3.10	Insufficiency of classical conjoint measurement	144
4.3.10.1	Flexible CSP	144
4.3.10.2	Non-transitive preferences	145
4.3.10.3	PROMETHEEII	145
4.3.11	Conclusion	147
4.4	Parameters	147
4.4.1	Direct rating	148
4.4.2	Simos' cards method	149
4.4.3	Ranking the criteria	150
4.4.4	Analytic Hierarchy Process (AHP)	151
4.4.5	A classical technique in MAVT	151
4.4.6	General approach	153
4.4.7	Laplace's principle	154
4.5	Methods	156
4.5.1	AHP	157
4.5.1.1	The method	157
4.5.1.2	Some pointers	158
4.5.2	ELECTREI	159
4.5.2.1	The method	159
4.5.2.2	Some pointers	160
4.5.3	ELECTRE III	161
4.5.3.1	The method	161
4.5.3.2	Some pointers	162

4.5.4	MAVT.	162
4.5.4.1	The method	162
4.5.4.2	Some pointers.	163
4.5.5	PROMETHEE II.	163
4.5.5.1	The method	163
4.5.5.2	Some pointers.	165
4.5.6	TACTIC.	165
4.5.6.1	The method	165
4.5.6.2	Some pointers.	166
4.6	Limitations of the axiomatic approach.	167
	Aggregation procedures	169
5.1	Aggregation functions.	169
5.2	Aggregation of preference relations.	170
5.2.1	The simple majority or Condorcet method	171
5.2.1.1	Axioms and characterisation.	171
5.2.1.2	Discussion	173
5.2.1.3	When simple majority fails.	174
5.2.1.4	Condorcet and TACTIC.	176
5.2.1.5	What do we do with a non-transitive relation?	177
5.2.2	Weighted simple majority.	178
5.2.2.1	Axioms and characterisation.	178
5.2.2.2	Discussion	180
5.2.2.3	Cyclical preferences.	180
5.2.2.4	Choosing the weights	180
5.2.2.5	TACTIC and Condorcet	182
5.2.3	Absolute and qualified majorities	183
5.2.3.1	Axioms and characterisation.	183
5.2.3.2	Discussion	184
5.2.3.3	Cyclical preferences.	185
5.2.3.4	Choosing the concordance threshold	185
5.2.3.5	The qualified majority and ELECTRE I.	187
5.2.4	The lexicographic method.	188
5.2.4.1	Axioms and characterisation	190
5.2.4.2	Discussion.	190
5.3	Aggregation of fuzzy relations.	192
5.3.1	Construction of fuzzy preference relations.	193
5.3.2	The Generalised Borda method.	194
5.3.2.1	Axioms and characterisation.	195
5.3.2.2	Discussion	196
5.3.2.3	Generalised Borda and PROMETHEE II.	196
5.3.3	The Generalised Condorcet method.	197
5.3.3.1	Does it make sense to add the valuations?	198
5.3.3.2	Other possible extensions	198
5.3.3.3	Transitivity.	199
5.3.3.4	ELECTRE III.	199

5.3.4	Pairwise aggregation into a fuzzy relation.	199
5.3.5	General comment on the aggregation into a fuzzy relation	200
5.3.6	The difficulty of aggregating fuzzy relations.	202
5.4	Aggregation of a performance table.	202
5.4.1	Notations and definitions.	203
5.4.2	A comment about commensurability.	205
5.4.3	The min.	207
5.4.3.1	Axioms and characterisation.	207
5.4.3.2	Discussion.	208
5.4.4	The weighted sum.	209
5.4.4.1	Axioms and characterisation.	209
5.4.4.2	Discussion.	210
5.4.4.3	Choosing the weights.	212
5.4.5	The leximin and leximax.	214
5.4.5.1	Axioms and characterisation.	215
5.4.5.2	Discussion.	216
5.4.6	The outranking procedures.	218
5.4.6.1	Discussion.	221
5.4.6.2	The outranking procedures and ELECTRE I	223
5.5	Aggregation of a linguistic performance table.	224
5.6	Choice functions.	225
5.6.1	Adapting the axioms to the choice problem.	226
5.7	Aggregation of performances into a performance.	227
5.7.1	Notation.	229
5.7.2	The arithmetic mean.	229
5.7.2.1	Axioms and characterisation.	230
5.7.2.2	Discussion.	233
5.7.3	Quasi-arithmetic means.	233
5.7.4	Min, max and the other order statistics.	234
5.7.5	Weighted mean, weighted sum.	234
	Multi-dimensional preference models	237
6.1	The additive value model.	238
6.1.1	Independence and marginal preferences.	238
6.1.2	The additive value model in the "rich" case.	241
6.1.2.1	The case of two dimensions.	241
6.1.2.2	The case of more than two dimensions.	247
6.1.2.3	Standard sequences and beyond.	250
6.1.3	The additive value model in the "finite" case.	251
6.2	Models based on marginal traces.	254
6.2.1	Decomposable preferences.	255
6.2.2	Eliciting the general decomposable model.	256
6.2.3	Non-strict decomposable model.	258
6.2.3.1	The non-strict decomposable model.	258
6.2.3.2	Eliciting the non-strict decomposable model	259
6.2.4	Insufficiency of the decomposable model.	259

6.2.5	Insufficiency of marginal analysis: marginal traces.	261
6.2.6	Generalising decomposable models using marginal traces.	263
6.2.7	Models using marginal traces.	267
6.2.8	Respect of the dominance relation.	268
6.2.9	Properties of marginal preferences.	270
6.2.9.1	Separability and independence.	271
6.2.9.2	The case of weak orders.	271
6.2.10	Eliciting the variants.	272
6.3	Models based on marginal traces on differences.	273
6.3.1	The additive difference model.	273
6.3.2	Comparison of preference differences.	275
6.3.3	A general family of models using traces on differences . . .	276
6.3.4	Eliciting models using traces on differences.	280
6.3.4.1	Testing.	281
6.3.5	Models distinguishing three classes of differences.	282
6.3.5.1	Simple, majority or the Condorcet method.	283
6.3.5.2	Weighted simple majority.	284
6.3.5.3	Weighted qualified majority.	284
6.3.5.4	Lexicographic preference relations.	289
6.3.5.5	Other forms of weighted qualified majority	290
6.3.6	Examples of models using vetoes.	293
6.3.6.1	Weighted qualified majority with veto.	295
6.3.6.2	Weighted relative majority: threshold and veto . . .	296
6.3.7	Models distinguishing five classes of differences.	298
6.3.8	Models distinguishing many classes of differences.	301
6.4	Models using both traces.	303
6.4.1	Marginal traces and traces on differences.	304
6.4.2	Eliciting models using both kinds of traces.	306
6.4.2.1	Procedure.	306
6.4.2.2	Elicitation.	309
6.4.3	Models distinguishing five classes of differences.	310
6.4.3.1	The weighted majority model revisited.	310
6.4.3.2	Other models.	311
6.5	Weakly differentiated preference differences.	311
6.5.1	Concordance relations.	312
6.5.1.1	The importance relation.	313
6.5.1.2	Preference relations on attributes.	314
6.5.2	Relationship with actual outranking methods.	316
6.5.2.1	Elicitation issues.	317
6.6	Models for valued preferences.	318
6.6.1	The measurement of preference differences.	319
6.6.2	Fuzzy preference relations.	320
6.7	Social choice vs. Conjoint measurement.	322

Making recommendation	327
7.1 Introduction	327
7.1.1 Position of the problem	327
7.1.2 What kind of recommendation?	328
7.1.2.1 Choosing	329
7.1.2.2 Ranking	329
7.1.2.3 Sorting	330
7.2 Using a value function	332
7.2.1 Relative evaluation	333
7.2.1.1 Choosing	333
7.2.1.2 Ranking	334
7.2.2 Absolute evaluation: Sorting	335
7.2.2.1 Limiting profiles	335
7.2.2.2 Prototypes	336
7.3 Using several value functions	337
7.3.1 Linear programming assessment	337
7.3.1.1 Beyond standard sequences	338
7.3.1.2 Linear Programming assessment techniques	340
7.3.1.3 Variants of LP based assessment	342
7.3.1.3.1 UTA	342
7.3.1.3.2 MACBETH	344
7.3.2 Choosing with a set of additive value functions	347
7.3.3 Ranking with a set of additive value functions	348
7.3.4 Sorting with a set of additive value functions	348
7.3.5 Example: Thierry's choice	349
7.3.5.1 Thierry's choice	349
7.3.5.2 Using UTA	351
7.3.5.3 Choosing	352
7.3.5.4 Ranking	353
7.3.5.5 Sorting	353
7.4 Other preference models	355
7.4.1 The extent of the problem	355
7.4.1.1 Simple majority	355
7.4.1.2 ELECTRE-1	356
7.4.1.3 ELECTRE III	357
7.4.2 How things may go wrong: examples	358
7.4.3 Choice procedures	361
7.4.3.1 Crisp relations	362
7.4.3.1.1 Procedures based on covering relations	363
7.4.3.1.2 Procedures based on kernels	365
7.4.3.1.3 Other procedures	368
7.4.3.2 Valued relations	368
7.4.3.2.1 Use of A-cuts	369
7.4.3.2.2 Fuzzyfication of crisp procedures	369
7.4.3.2.3 Procedures based on scores	370
7.4.3.2.4 Examples	371

7.4.4	Ranking procedures.	372
7.4.4.1	Crisp relations.	372
7.4.4.1.1	Using the transitive closure	373
7.4.4.1.2	Copeland scores.	376
7.4.4.1.3	Ranking by repeated choice.	377
7.4.4.1.4	Use of distances.	379
7.4.4.2	Valued relations.	380
7.4.5	Sorting procedures.	380
7.4.5.1	An overview of ELECTRE TRI	381
7.4.5.2	Implementation of ELECTRE TRI	384
7.5	Robustness of the conclusions.	385
7.5.1	Introduction.	385
7.5.2	Robustness versus stability.	386
7.5.3	Alternative definitions of robustness in the literature	386
7.5.4	Robustness illustrated: examples.	388
7.5.5	Robust methods.	395
7.5.6	Back to Thierry's choice.	395
7.5.7	Robustness and MCDA.	396
7.5.8	Summary and open questions.	397
8	Conclusion	399
8.1	Did we keep our promise?.	399
8.2	Decision Aiding Methodology.	401
8.3	Decision aiding approaches and tools.	403
8.4	Preference modelling	403
8.5	Preference aggregation.	404
8.6	Final stepping stones.	406
8.7	And after all this?.	407
	Bibliography	409
	Name Index	433
	Subject Index	439