

Cultural Products and the World Trade Organization

Tania Voon



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

| | |
|---|----------------|
| <i>Detailed chapter outline</i> | page ix |
| <i>Table of GATT/WTO agreements</i> | xiii |
| <i>Table of GATT/WTO cases</i> | xiv |
| <i>Table of abbreviations</i> | xvii |
| GATT/WTO agreements | xvii |
| GATT/WTO cases | xviii |
| Other abbreviations | xxvi |
| <i>Foreword</i> | xxxi |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xxxiv |
| Part I Stalemate and its ideological origins | 1 |
| 1 Trade and culture | 3 |
| 2 A case study of cultural products: protectionism vs cultural policy | 37 |
| 3 What's wrong with the current treatment of cultural products? | 69 |
| Part II Options for the future | 121 |
| 4 Resolution through dispute settlement and international law | 123 |
| 5 Constructing a new agreement outside the WTO | 173 |
| 6 Improving the existing WTO agreements | 217 |
| 7 Conclusion | 248 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 257 |
| Non-WTO agreements, cases, statutes, and treaties | 257 |
| Other official documents and reports | 259 |
| Articles, books, chapters, and papers | 271 |
| <i>Index</i> | 295 |

Detailed chapter outline

| | |
|--|--------|
| 1 Trade and culture | page 3 |
| 1.1 'Trade and ...' problems | 3 |
| 1.2 Cultural implications of WTO rules | 11 |
| 1.3 Cultural industries, cultural products, and cultural policy measures | 18 |
| 1.3.1 Definitions | 18 |
| 1.3.2 Common cultural policy measures | 19 |
| 1.3.3 Significance in the WTO | 23 |
| 1.3.4 Significance in other international contexts | 29 |
| 1.4 Towards a solution | 33 |
| 2 A case study of cultural products: protectionism vs cultural policy | 37 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 37 |
| 2.2 Legitimacy of State support for cultural products | 39 |
| 2.2.1 The nature of cultural products | 39 |
| 2.2.2 Promoting or preserving culture through cultural products | 41 |
| 2.3 Justification for discriminatory cultural policy measures | 43 |
| 2.3.1 The market for cultural products | 43 |
| A. US dominance | 44 |
| B. Positive externalities of cultural products | 50 |
| 2.3.2 The need for discrimination | 54 |
| A. Against foreign cultural products | 54 |
| B. Between foreign cultural products | 59 |
| 2.4 Evaluating cultural policy measures in the WTO | 60 |
| 2.4.1 Motives for cultural policy measures | 60 |
| 2.4.2 Effectiveness of cultural policy measures | 61 |
| 2.4.3 Minimising trade restrictions | 64 |
| 2.5 Conclusion | 67 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3 What's wrong with the current treatment of cultural products? | 69 |
| 3.1 Introduction | 69 |
| 3.2 Cultural products as goods and services | 70 |
| 3.2.1 Basic definitions and classifications | 70 |
| 3.2.2 Digital products | 73 |
| 3.3 Presumed 'likeness' of cultural products | 75 |
| 3.3.1 Likeness under GATT 1994 | 76 |
| A. Like products | 76 |
| B. Directly competitive or substitutable products | 80 |
| C. Aims-and-effects test | 82 |
| 3.3.2 Like services and service suppliers under GATS | 85 |
| 3.4 Unbalanced and uncertain exceptions | 89 |
| 3.4.1 Government-supplied services | 90 |
| 3.4.2 Screen quotas | 92 |
| 3.4.3 Subsidies | 96 |
| A. GATT Articles III:8(b) and XVI and the SCM Agreement | 96 |
| B. GATS Article XV | 98 |
| 3.4.4 General exceptions (GATT Article XX, GATS Article XIV) | 100 |
| A. Structure and <i>chapeau</i> | 100 |
| B. National treasures | 104 |
| C. Public morals and public order | 105 |
| 3.5 The GATS outcome | 109 |
| 3.5.1 Limited national treatment and market access commitments | 109 |
| 3.5.2 Excessive MFN exemptions | 113 |
| 3.6 Conclusion | 117 |
| 4 Resolution through dispute settlement and international law | 123 |
| 4.1 Introduction | 123 |
| 4.2 The role of international law in interpreting WTO law | 124 |
| 4.2.1 Relevant provisions | 125 |
| A. Article 3.2 of the DSU | 125 |
| B. Article 31 of the VCLT | 126 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 4.2.2 Use of international law by the Appellate Body | 128 |
| A. Significance of past Appellate Body Reports | 128 |
| B. Ordinary meaning (VCLT Article 31(1)) | 130 |
| C. International law between the parties (VCLT Article 31(3)(c)) | 137 |
| 4.3 Using international law to interpret WTO law on cultural products | 142 |
| 4.3.1 National treasures | 143 |
| 4.3.2 A human rights approach to cultural products | 149 |
| 4.3.3 Public morals and public order | 156 |
| 4.3.4 Screen quotas | 159 |
| 4.3.5 Protecting human life or health | 162 |
| 4.3.6 Securing compliance with other laws or regulations | 166 |
| 4.4 Conclusion | 171 |
| 5 Constructing a new agreement outside the WTO | 173 |
| 5.1 Introduction | 173 |
| 5.2 National and non-governmental initiatives | 175 |
| 5.2.1 Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade | 175 |
| 5.2.2 International Network on Cultural Policy | 178 |
| 5.2.3 International Network for Cultural Diversity | 181 |
| 5.3 UNESCO Convention on the Protection of the Diversity of Cultural Contents and Artistic Expressions | 183 |
| 5.3.1 Background | 183 |
| 5.3.2 Key features of the UNESCO Convention | 185 |
| 5.3.3 Implications for the WTO | 189 |
| A. WTO Members' views on the UNESCO Convention | 189 |
| B. Conduct of UNESCO Convention parties in the WTO | 194 |
| C. Complaints relating to the UNESCO Convention | 199 |
| D. The UNESCO Convention as a defence to a WTO violation | 202 |
| 5.4 Conclusion | 216 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 6 Improving the existing WTO agreements | 217 |
| 6.1 Introduction | 217 |
| 6.2 Improving treatment of cultural products under GATT 1994 | 219 |
| 6.2.1 Screen quotas: remove or modify | 219 |
| 6.2.2 A new general exception? | 220 |
| 6.3 Improving treatment of cultural products under GATS | 223 |
| 6.3.1 Digital cultural products as services | 223 |
| 6.3.2 Mandated national treatment, market access, and MFN | 225 |
| 6.3.3 Escape routes | 227 |
| A. Discriminatory subsidies | 227 |
| B. Developing country Members | 232 |
| C. Screen quotas | 233 |
| 6.4 Effecting changes | 234 |
| 6.5 Other proposals | 236 |
| 6.5.1 Anti-dumping measures against audiovisual services | 237 |
| 6.5.2 Cultural diversity safeguards | 239 |
| 6.5.3 Intellectual property rights and anti-competitive conduct | 243 |
| 6.6 Conclusion | 246 |
| 7 Conclusion | 248 |
| Bibliography | 257 |
| Index | 295 |