

1817

WORLD BANK LATIN AMERICAN
AND CARIBBEAN STUDIES

Viewpoints

BEYOND THE
✓
CENTER:
DECENTRALIZING
THE STATE

Shahid Javed Burki
Guillermo E. Perry
William R. Dillinger

**THE WORLD BANK
WASHINGTON, D.C.**

 hcn-optology

www.hcn-optology.com

Tel +44 (0) 1420 86848

Fax +44 (0) 1420 89889

e-mail info@hcn-optology.com

Omega Park Alton Hampshire
GU34 2PG UK

Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
Acronyms and Abbreviations	ix
X Prologue: Matching Authority and Accountability	1
Chapter 1: Decentralization: Politics in Command	9
The Roots of Centralism	9
The Wind Changes	10
Eight Cases	10
Federal Countries Reverting to Type	11
Civilian Regimes Unleashing Local Electoral Competition	11
Two-tier States	13
Chapter 2: Getting the Rules Right: A Framework for Subnational Government	17
Dividing Up National Political Power	18
Assigning Functions, Structures, and Revenues	21
Functions	21
Structure	24
Revenues: Taxes and Transfers	26
Controlling Subnational Debt	29
Local Politics	31
Strategies	32
Synchronizing the Elements of Reform	33
Demonstrating Early Commitment to the New Rules of the Game	33
Conclusion	34
Chapter 3: Addressing the Macroeconomic Threat: The Quest for Hard Budget Constraints	35
Evidence of Macroeconomic Problems: Econometric Results	37
Outcomes and Institutions in Major Decentralized States of Latin America	39
Hard Budget Constraints for Subnational Governments	39
Borrowing Constraints	40
Autonomy of Subnational Governments to Stay Within Budget Constraints	40
Revenue Autonomy	41
Political Ability to Enforce Hard Budget Constraints	41
Outcomes and Institutions in Four Latin American Countries	41
Summary of Cases	47
Decentralization Institutions and Fiscal Management	47
Hard Budget Constraints for Transfers and Service Responsibilities	47
Borrowing Constraints	49

Subnational Autonomy for Fiscal Adjustment	50
Intergovernmental Political Relations	51
Conclusion	51
Chapter 4: Empowering Municipalities or Schools? The Decentraization of Education.	53
Rationale for Education Decentralization	54
The Educational Context of Decentralization	55
Typology	55
Level of Decentralization	55
Decisionmaking Powers	56
Structure and Content	56
Typology Applied to Recent Latin American Experience	57
Level of Decentralization	57
Decisionmaking Powers	58
Structure and Content	59
Evaluation Decentralization	60
High-Performing Schools	60
Characteristics of Effective Schools	60
The Consequences of School Decentralization.	62
Leadership	62
Teaching Excellence	63
Focus on Learning	63
Responsibility	64
Empirical Findings.	64
Conclusion	66
Annex	69
Chapter 5: Empowering Mayors, Hospital Directors, or Patients? The Decentralization of Health Care	75
Three Kinds of Health Services	75
Many Modes of Service Delivery and Financing	76
What has been Decentralized in Latin America and How	77
Argentina: From Central Monopoly to Provincial Monopoly.	77
Mexico: From Deconcentration to Decentralization	78
Bolivia: Municipalizing the Physical but not the Human Assets	79
Brazil: Public Financing with Private Production.	80
Chile: Municipalizing Production, Centralizing Financing	81
Colombia: Conflicts Between Decentralization and Privatization.	81
Major Issues in Decentralizing Health	82
Labor Management	82
Recurrent Financing.	82
Investment Decisions	83
The Political Economy of Reform	84
Conclusion	85
Chapter 6: Decentralizing Roads: Matching Accountability, Resources, and Technical Expertise	87
Decentralization in the Road Management Sector.	87
In Search of a Model: The Latin American and Caribbean Experience	89
What is Decentralization in the Road Sector?.	89
Road Functions	89
Management Tasks	90
Financing Mechanisms	91
Road Decentralization in Latin America.	92
Where Political and Fiscal Decentralization is Well Established	93
Dangers of Rapid Decentralization	94
Benefits to National Networks of Devolving Non-National Roads	95
Contribution of Parallel Reforms	95

Delegation of National Roads	97
Conclusion	97

References	99
-------------------------	-----------

Boxes

Box P.1	What is Decentralization?	3
Box 2.1	A Glossary of Political Terms	20
Box 2.2	How Far to Decentralize?	22
Box 2.3	Are Local Governments Incompetent?	24
Box 2.4	Revenue Assignment in Federal Countries	29
Box 2.5	The Impact of Transfers on Local Political Behavior	30
Box 3.1	Risks and Costs in the Source and Terms of Borrowing	50
Box 4.1	Chicago: An Initial Emphasis on Governance	66
Box 4.2	Memphis: Decentralization Focused on Improving Learning	67
Box 4.A.1	What Has Been Learned from Effective Reform Strategies?	73
Box 5.1	Lack of Reliable Information	84
Box 6.1	The New Generation of Road Funds	92
Box 6.2	Key Features of the Contrato de Recuperación Mantenimiento (CREMA).	96

Tables

Table P.1	Summary of Decentralization Measures	2
Table 1.1	Summary of Decentralization Measures in Selected Countries	14
Table 1.2	Indicators of Decentralization	15
Table 2.1	Electoral Rules, Selected Latin American Countries	19
Table 2.2	Electoral Rules, Selected OECD Countries	20
Table 2.3	Structure of Subnational Governments: Selected OECD and Latin American Countries	26
Table 2.4	Principal Revenue Sources of Subnational Governments	27
Table 2.5	Sources of Revenues: Percent Distribution, Selected Countries	28
Table 3.1	Basic Model: Cross Section; Overall Sample Estimates	37
Table 3.2	Panel Data, Fiscal Variables in First Differences, 1980–94.	38
Table 3.3	Institutional Arrangements to Set and Keep Hard Budget Constraints on States	39
Table 3.4	Summary of Conditions for Reduced Danger of Excess Deficits	48
Table 3.5	Channels for Control of Subnational Borrowing	49
Table 4.1	Types of Decisions that may be Decentralized.	57
Table 4.2	The Locus of Key Educational Decisions and Responsibilities, Selected Latin American Countries	59
Table 4.3	Characteristics that can be Stimulated Through Decentralization.	61
Table 4.4	Assessment of Education Decentralization	63
Table 4.A.1	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Argentina, Education Reforms 1976–1991	69
Table 4.A.2	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Chicago, IL, Education Reforms 1988–1999	69
Table 4.A.3	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Chile, Education Reforms 1981	69
Table 4.A.4	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System El Salvador, Community-Managed Schools (EDUCO).	70
Table 4.A.5	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Memphis, TN, Education Reforms 1995–1999	70
Table 4.A.6	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Mexico, Education Reforms 1992–1998.	70
Table 4.A.7	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Minas Gerais, Brazil	71
Table 4.A.8	Characteristics of “Decentralized” School System Nicaragua, Education Reforms 1993–1998	71
Table 4.A.9	Summary of Characteristics of Decentralized Schools.	72
Table 5.1	Suggested Financing and Provision for Different Types of Health Services	76
Table 5.2	Authority to Manage Personnel by Different Levels of Government.	83
Table 5.3	Authority to Make Infrastructure Investments	83
Table 6.1	Decentralization Options for the Road Sector	91

Figures

Figure 4.1	Latin American Countries Implementing Education Reforms.	54
Figure 4.2	Average Math Achievement Test Scores of Eighth Graders, Selected International Comparators	55
Figure 4.3	Third-Grade Language Achievement, Latin American Countries	56
Figure 4.4	Level of Decisionmaking in Education Sector	58