Interpretation and Revision of
International Boundary Decisions

Kaiyan Homi Kaikobad
University of Durham
Contents

List of maps xiii
Preface xv
Acknowledgments xviii
Table of cases xx
List of abbreviations xxvi

Part I Introduction

1 Introduction 3
   I. Preliminary observations 3
   II. Fundamental parameters and perspectives 11

Part II The settlement of territorial and boundary disputes

2 Problems in settlement 17
   I. Preliminary observations 17
   II. Territorial settlements: international law, armed conflict and self-determination 22
      a. General 22
      b. Post-conflict settlements: territorial and boundary issues 23
      c. Concluding analysis 29
   III. Territorial settlements: peaceful methods, dissatisfaction and legal effects 31
        a. General 31
        b. Specific issues and disputes 32
           1. Problems based on State and government succession 33
           2. Problems based on unilateral renunciation 41
3. Problems based on unilateral rejection of boundary awards and decisions 43
4. Problems based on constitutive legal considerations 46
c. Concluding analysis 52

IV. The arbitration and adjudication of territorial and boundary disputes: dissatisfaction and international law 53
a. Arbitration and territorial disputes: historical background 53
b. Arbitration and territorial and boundary disputes: consolidation 60
c. Sources of dissatisfaction and dispute: treaties and arbitral and judicial decisions 68
d. Arbitral and judicial decisions: nullity, revision and interpretation 70

V. Concluding analysis: dissatisfaction, finality and reconciliation 77

Part III Judicial remedies: interpretation

3 The interpretation of judgments and awards 85
   I. Preliminary observations 85
   II. Evolution of the notion of interpretation 86
      a. General 86
      b. The Hague Peace Conferences 86
      c. Developments since 1907 and the Great War: the Statute of the Permanent Court of International Justice 89
      d. The Statute of the International Court of Justice 92
      e. Judicial contribution in the development of the notion 93

4 The classification of the notion of interpretation 95
   I. Preliminary observations 95
   II. Interpretation as incidental to the main case 95
   III. Main case interpretation 97

5 Legal issues regarding interpretation 102
   I. Preliminary observations 102
   II. Interpretation and the role of consent 102
III. Admissibility of requests for interpretation 115  
   a. The existence of a dispute 116  
   b. Operative part of the decision 117  
   c. Meaning and scope of the decision 124  
   d. Restrictions ratione temporis 125  
   e. Restrictions based in treaty interpretation 130  

IV. Purpose and scope of interpretation 135  
   a. Bona fide need for clarification 135  
   b. Restrictive aspects of interpretation 138  
   c. Tests for interpretation 141  
   d. Modification, revision and res judicata 143  
   e. The admission and rejection of requests: anomalous features 156  
   f. Interpretation in the context of the general task of the tribunal 161  

V. Interpretation and the principle of res judicata 162  
   a. General points of contact 163  
   b. Reconciliation and harmonisation 170  

6 Principles of interpretation 175  
   I. Preliminary observations 175  
   II. Words, meanings and the general practice of international tribunals 178  
   III. Presumption against a breach of the law 180  
   IV. Materials, conduct and relevant circumstances: admissibility and probative weight 193  
   V. The principle of effectiveness 210  
   VI. The doctrine of acquiescence, recognition and estoppel 211  
   VII. General recapitulation 225  

Part IV Judicial remedies: revision  

7 The revision of judgments and awards 231  
   I. Preliminary observations 231  
   II. Brief history of the evolution of the notion of revision 233  
      a. Early writers and the nineteenth century 233  
      b. The Hague Peace Conferences and other treaties 236  
      c. Developments since the Great War: the Statute of the Permanent Court of International Justice 243  
      d. The inter-war years 248
Contents

8 General features of revision 252
   I. Preliminary observations 252
   II. Revision as a remedy based in consent 252
   III. Revision as a remedy to be exercised in exceptional circumstances 257

9 The classification of the notion of revision 261
   I. Preliminary observations 261
   II. Revision incidental to the main case 261
   III. Main case revision 262

10 Issues of admissibility 265
   I. Preliminary observations 265
   II. Substantive criteria 267
      a. Discovery of fact 267
      b. The existence of newly discovered facts or evidence 271
      c. Decisive character of newly discovered facts or evidence 278
         1. Decisive facts qua facts 278
         2. Evidence as decisive fact 281
         3. Decisiveness of fact and evidence at the admissibility and merits stages 289
      d. Negligence in discovery 292
   III. Procedural criteria 298

11 Selected substantive and procedural aspects of revision 302
   I. Preliminary observations 302
   II. Revision and res judicata 303
   III. Revision and indirect delimitation 311
   IV. Revision at the merits stage 313
   VI. General recapitulation 319

Part V Conclusions 325

12 Conclusions 325

Select bibliography 340
Index 353