

An Appealing Option? The Debate about an ICSID Appellate Structure

By

Christian J. Tams

Essays in Transnational Economic Law
No. 57 / June 2006

Institut für Wirtschaftsrecht
Forschungsstelle für Transnationales Wirtschaftsrecht
Juristische Fakultät der Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg

CONTENT

A. Introduction	5
B. Current Options for Reviewing Decisions	7
I. ICSID Convention Awards	7
II. Awards not Rendered under the ICSID Convention	10
C. Obstacles to Reform	12
I. Political Feasibility	12
II. "Finality" (Time, Cost and Trust)	14
D. Arguments for Introducing an Appeals Facility	17
I. Consistency	17
1. General Considerations on Consistency	17
2. Problems of Inconsistency under the Present System	18
3. Could an Appellate System Remedy the Problem?	23
4. Interim Assessment	25
II. Accuracy	26
III. Authority	28
1. ICSID Convention Awards	29
2. Additional Facility Awards	30
3. Interim Assessment	31
IV. Investor Bias	31
V. Interim Conclusions	33
E. Alternatives to an Appeals Facility	34
I. A Broader Role for Annulment Committees	36
II. Consolidating Cases	37
III. Reference Procedures	38
1. References to the International Court of Justice	38
2. A Reference Procedure Along the Lines of Article 234 TEC	40
IV. Interim Assessment	41
F. Concluding Observations	41
Appendix	43
References	48